

A Shoshone/Goshute Traditional Cultural Property and Cultural Landscape, Spring Valley, Nevada

Prepared at the Request of the

Confederated Tribes of the Goshute Reservation

P.O. Box 6104
Ibapah, UT 84034

Cooperating Tribes

Ely Shoshone Tribe
16 Shoshone Circle
Ely, NV 89310

Duckwater Shoshone Tribe
P.O. Box 1400068
Duckwater, Nevada 89310

By

Sylvester L. Lahren, Jr. Ph.D.
Tribal Ethnographer/ Principal Investigator
Confederated Tribes of the Goshute Reservation

Note: Confidential and Proprietary Report for the Goshute Tribal Council

First Draft August 9, 2010

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction.....	4
Ethnographer’s Qualifications	5
Spring Valley Nevada.....	6
Prehistoric Period.....	6
Ethnographic Context.....	6
Julian H. Steward 1938	6
Steward’s Spring Valley Villages	6
Steward’s Village 12’s Location.....	8
Key Ethnographic Characteristics of Village 12.....	9
Village 12’s Festival Connections With Other Villages.....	9
Festival Sites on Steward’s Figure 9	10
Conclusions on the Centrality of Spring Valley and Village 12’s Festival Location.....	11
Winter Villages.....	11
Food Resources of Spring Valley.....	12
Pine Nuts	12
Hunting.....	12
Agriculture.....	13
Festivals/Dances.....	13
Pottery	14
Spiritual Belief System.....	15
Culturally Significant Ethnographic Conclusions.....	15
Euroamerican invasion of the Area	16
1859 Simpson Invades Spring Valley	16
1860-1861: The Pony Express and Overland Mail Invasion.....	17
Military Invasion of the Area.....	17
March 1, 1860: General Johnston Ordered to Leave Camp Floyd.....	17
Summer/Fall 1860.....	18
August 20, 1860 Cooke Assumes Command of Camp Floyd.....	18
July 27, 1861: Fort Crittenden Abandoned.....	18
Reasons for Indian-Euroamerican Conflict	18
Spring Valley Ethnohistorical Sources	19
Ronald R. Bateman 1984.....	19
Bateman’s Spring Valley Incidents.....	20
Bateman’s Chronology of Conflict in Spring Valley	21
1860.....	21
1863.....	21
Elijah Nicolas Wilson 1910, 2005	22
1860-1861	22
1861 Spring Valley.....	22
Wilson’s First Hand Account of a Battle/Massacre by General Johnston.....	22
Thompson and West 1881	23
1863: Goshute War.....	23
1863, March 23: Canon Station Battle	24
1863, May 4: Duck Creek Battle	24

1863, May 6: Spring Valley Battle	24
1863, July 6: Canon Station Incident #2	24
1875 Spring Valley and the Eastern Nevada War Panic.....	25
Carlin Malouf 1940.....	25
Malouf on Wilson’s Massacre of 350 Indians by General Johnston	25
Conner’s Men Massacre Friendly Indians at Coyote’s Spring	26
Malouf Confirms Goshute’s Memory of Indians Massacred in Spring Valley.....	26
Southern Paiute Oral History of Indians Massacred in Spring Valley	26
Indians Massacred at Spring Valley: Indian Peak 24	26
Indians Massacred at Spring Valley and Elsewhere: Eagle Valley 2	27
Spring Valley Massacre and/or Battle Sites Analysis.....	27
Battles vs. Massacres	27
Wilson’s Battle/Massacre Site 1859?.....	28
Captain Smith’s Spring Valley Battle Site 1863.....	28
Steward’s Spring Valley Village 12 Massacre Site	28
Malouf’s Massacre Site.....	29
Martineau’s Massacre Sites	29
Spring Valley Massacre Site 1897	29
Conclusions: Battle vs. Massacre Sites	30
Native Consultants	31
Native Consultant 1.....	31
Native Consultant 2.....	32
Native Consultant 3.....	33
Native Consultant 4.....	34
Native Consultant 5.....	35
Native Consultant 6.....	35
Native Consultant 7.....	37
Conclusions Based on the Native Consultant’s Statements.....	37
Summary Ethnohistorical/ Ethnographic Conclusions	38
Traditional Cultural Property (TCP)	39
Swamp Cedar Area Traditional Cultural Property Evaluation	40
Recommendation for Protection of the TCP.....	41
Ethnographic Landscape	42
Executive Order 13007, Indian Sacred Land Executive Order	42
References Cited.....	44

INTRODUCTION

This introduction describes the series of events that made it necessary for me to prepare a second ethnographic report based on my new 2010 research on Spring Valley Nevada. This new independent research report allows it to become the property of the Confederated Tribes of the Goshute Reservation and the Native consultants. In June 2009, my draft ethnographic report titled *Appendix D: Confidential Spring Valley Ethnographic Report* was sent to the Ely BLM office for their review. The fieldwork component of my research for this June 2009 document was conducted in October of 2008 and the ethnohistorical research was completed early in 2009. I conducted all of the background ethnohistorical research and ethnographic fieldwork for Appendix D and was the sole author of the report. It represented my work product and I was responsible for all content, analysis and conclusions.

On December 14, 2009, I was informed that my June 2009 report had been revised and sent back to the BLM. That same day, I contacted my supervisor and requested electronic copies of the revised document so I could see the changes that had been made to my report without my knowledge. On December 15, 2009, I received, via email, a pdf of the December 2009 report titled *Ethnographic Investigations for the Spring Valley Wind Facility in White Pine County, Nevada*, that was sent to the BLM, an electronic file of the BLM comments, and the “new” authors’ responses to them. On this revised report my name appears as the first name in the preparers list, but I had nothing to do with the preparation of this second draft.

I did a comparison of the two reports and concluded that material changes had occurred to my June 2009 report. Most of these changes were to the “Ethnographic Conclusions” and “Mitigation Recommendations” sections of the report. These sections were completely rewritten by the “new authors” and do not reflect my conclusions.

I sent an email to my supervisor stating that I had serious objections to this revised report and on January 20, 2010, I had a telephone discussion with my supervisor, regarding my concerns with the revised report. At the end of that discussion, I was offered the opportunity to write a rebuttal to the report. During a subsequent phone discussion with my supervisor I was informed that the BLM would also consider my rebuttal as proprietary information and that I could not share it with anyone. This statement by the BLM negated the purpose of doing a rebuttal to clarify the substantive changes that were made to my report.

On January 22, 2010, I received a formal apology from my supervisor which stated:

I am writing to offer an apology regarding the Spring Valley Ethnographic Report. I should have called you to tell you we received a request from the BLM for revisions to the report, and I did not. I owed you the professional courtesy of contacting you and I am very sorry that I failed to do so. The Salt Lake City office completed the requested revisions without your knowledge, and you did not have an opportunity to provide comments on the requested revisions or on the revised document. In short, you did not have any involvement in preparing the revised document (HS 2010).

There is an important professional ethical problem for me that has existed since my June 2009 draft research report was sent to the Ely BLM. I was under the assumption that when the BLM received my draft report they would share it with the Native consultants and the Goshute Tribal Council. As of January 22, 2010, two of my Native consultants, after repeated requests, have not been allowed to see either the June 2009 report or the December 2009 report. As of July 2010, one of my Native consultants showed me they had a copy of the December 2009 report.

As part of my normal introductory comments to anyone I interview, I always explain to them that they will be able to see the results of my research. This promise is customary behavior for ethnographers working in the field of applied anthropology.

When I was doing my fieldwork for this project, I was specifically asked by my first Native consultant if they would get to see my report and I said, yes. I also had to have written authorization to conduct ethnographic interviews on the Goshute Reservation. I met with Tribal members on two occasions and, during those meetings, I assured those present that they would have access to my research report.

If I had not made these promises during the 2008-2009 Spring Valley project there would have been no fieldwork. Not allowing the Native people to see my report is a violation of my promise, as person, and my professional ethics as a Fellow of the Society for Applied Anthropology (Appendix A: Society for Applied Anthropology: Ethics and Professional Responsibility Statement). After all, the ethnographic data collected from the Native consultants is their intellectual property and there is no good reason to exclude them from seeing their own ethnographic facts.

In order to clear up all of the confusion concerned with the two reports discussed above and meet my ethical responsibilities to the Native people, I have agreed to conduct a new independent ethnographic study of Spring Valley and make those findings and recommendations available to the Native consultants and the Goshute Tribal Council. Only when they have complete access to my research, unfiltered, can they become fully informed about these significant ethnographic facts about their cultural heritage.

In July 2010, the Tribal Council of the Confederated Tribes of the Goshute Reservation passed a resolution approving me to conduct new independent ethnohistorical and ethnographic research that documents the Goshute/Shoshone cultural connections (i.e., historic use, massacre sites, etc.) to Spring Valley. In order to accomplish this request, I was to review the relevant ethnohistorical literature of the research area and conduct interviews with Native consultants who had knowledge about these topics. Ethnographic fieldwork for this report was conducted during the months of June and July 2010.

Ethnographer's Qualifications

In March of 2000 the National Park Service (Park Ethnography Program) published a bulletin titled "Essential Competencies – Ethnographer" which was an update to the GS-190 Series. In this publication they clearly set forth the requirements necessary for qualifying an individual as an ethnographer. Their qualification criteria are as follows: (1) Entry Level (GS-190) requires a Bachelor's Degree in anthropology with knowledge in cultural anthropology, (2) Developmental Level (GS-190) requires a Master's Degree with specialization in cultural anthropology and broad knowledge in applied cultural anthropology, and (3) Full Performance Level (GS-190) requires a Ph.D. with specialization in cultural anthropology and expertise in applied cultural anthropology. I meet the NPS requirements at the Full Performance Level (GS-109) (For more detail on the NPS requirements for each level see Appendix B: Essential Competencies – Ethnographer.).

SPRING VALLEY NEVADA

Prehistoric Period

Spring Valley is located in the archaeological subarea of the Great Basin defined as the Eastern Area (Aikens and Madsen 1986). The prehistoric period of human occupation in this Eastern Area begins at the end of the Pleistocene and continues until the advent of the Euroamerican invasion of the area (cf., Aikens and Madsen (1986), Madsen et al. (2005) and Schmitt and Madsen (2005) for the prehistory of the eastern area).

Ethnographic Context

In the Handbook of North American Indians, volume 11 (Great Basin) on page ix, d' Azevedo (1968) has a map titled *Key to Tribal Territories*. Using this map as a reference it shows that Spring Valley is located in the tribal territory of the Western Shoshone (Appendix C:Figure 1). The following presentation of ethnographic information only includes facts that are germane to the ethnographic context of Spring Valley. The spelling of Shoshone and Goshute varies from author to author (e.g., Steward (1938), Malouf (1940) and some use Shoshoni and Gosiute; others use Shoshone and Goshute. I use Shoshone and Goshute except when citing an exact quote from an author, then I use their spelling.

Julian H. Steward 1938

In 1938 Julian H. Steward published the first ethnographic study of the cultural groups located in the Spring Valley (Appendix C: Figure 2). In his classic text, he refers to them as the "S-SprV,* Shoshoni of Spring Valley, eastern Nevada and western Utah; sometimes called Gosiute" (Steward 1938:x). He says that the groups occupying the northern area of Spring Valley were Shoshoni and occasionally the residents of Spring Valley have been referred to as Gosiute. On page 123, Steward (1938) says that it was not possible to make a distinction between the Gosiute or Shoshone on the basis of culture or language.

Steward makes the following comments about the environment of Spring Valley:

Spring Valley and Snake Valleys are particularly favored environmentally by the presence of lofty ranges. The Shell Creek Range, which separates Steptoe from Spring Valley, rises above the pinyon belt [5,000 and 8,000 feet] and has numerous springs and streams which permitted many villages on its eastern slope (Steward 1938:124).

In spite of the enormous height of the Snake Mountains, the greater part of its drainage runs off the eastern slope into Snake Valley, where it supported several large communities. There was sufficient water to support only three villages on the western or Spring Valley slope (pl. 3, a) (Steward 1938:127).

This Spring Valley settlement pattern (i.e., village concentration on eastern slopes) is clearly depicted in Steward's (1938:125) Figure 9.

Steward's Spring Valley Villages

Steward (1938:124-128) identified 16 villages in Spring Valley and he plotted them on his Figure 9 located on page 125. The following descriptions are exact quotes taken from Steward's text and contain important ethnographic information in each description (initials JR and HJ refer to Steward's informants).

1. Tupa (black water), about 7 miles north of Anderson's ranch. Two families; about 15 people.

2. Supuva, at Anderson's ranch. Three camps; about 20 people.

The chief of these two villages was Sitump, living at Tupa. These villagers most often went to Antelope Valley, where they joined local residents and Deep Creek people in antelope drives and occasionally in festivals; sometimes, however, they went south to Cleveland in Spring Valley. Wherever they went, Puyunzugo (puyu, duck + zugu, old man) was the "talker and organizer" who assisted the shaman in antelope drives. (Puyunzugo, however, JR later gave as chief of village 10, below). These two villages usually held their own rabbit drives locally.

3. Wongovitwuninogwap: (wongovi, "white pine" + wunin, log + ogwap:, creek), on Valley Creek, at Yellen's (?) ranch, about 10 miles north of Cleveland. Probably about three families. Nuaidu (wind), living at (8), below, was chief for this village.

4. Basawinuba, location uncertain; either 3 or 4 miles northwest of Aurun at a spring about 1 mile north of village 5, or near Anderson's ranch. About two families.

5. Aidumba (aidu, murky + pa, water), at a spring west of Aurun. About seven families. Some doubt about chief. He was either Ovitc, Mugin (who directed pine-nut trips), or Kwati (who seems later to have gone to Deep Creek). Possibly all three men served at once or at different times.

6. Sosowosugu (sogop, earth + wosugu, "bridge," i.e., a bridge over some creek), at Aurun. Either 3 or 4 families; about 20 persons. Chief was Bauwi (a plant?), known as Bob.

The people inhabiting villages 4 to 6 allied themselves either with the Antelope Valley people or with Cleveland people for festivals and antelope hunts. Thus Sogowosugu people went north to Panwiowep or south to near Cleveland for dances.

7. Basawinuba (basawinu, mud), Mud Springs, about 7 miles south of Aurun. About 2 families here.

8. Haiva (hai, crow, so called because crows had nests in the rocks here), about 6 miles north of Cleveland, or two canyons south of village 3. Four families. Village chief called Nuaidu (wind).

Nuaidu announced pine-nut time and directed pine-nut gathering, when all four families went and camped together. Haiva people attended festivals at Cleveland ranch, where Nuaidu was one of the talkers. Sometimes they visited festivals at Baker. For antelope drives and rabbit drives they affiliated with Cleveland people.

9. Basamba (basa, dry, i.e., dry in the summer because of small local winter snowfall), slightly up the hill west of village 6, above. About 8 camps here, or some 35 people.

The village chief, who served mainly as pine-nut director, was Sigodagitci (sigo, sego lily + dagitci, ?). Sigodagitci aided in leading antelope drives wherever the Basamba people went, but was not an antelope shaman. They held rabbit drives in brushy country near Suhuva, in Antelope Valley, where Sigodagitci may have been director.

10. Tuhuva (tuhu, black + pa, water), between Yellen's and Cleveland's ranches. About three families. Village chief, Puyunzugo (but see villages 1 and 2, above).

11. Biabauwundu (biandu, big + pa, water + wundu, down canyon), **at Cleveland ranch; the largest and most important village in the valley** [emphasis mine, see Figures 2 and 2a]. About 11 families. The chiefs in order of importance were: (1) Bohoa, also called One-Eye, (2) Kuviji (short or stocky + man?), also known as Biabauwundu Pete, (3) Duuyumbo (duuyu, deer + bo, ?), (4) Nepia (white man's money), (5) Tunamp (mountain

mahogany), (6) Takavi (snow). These men talked and directed such communal activities as pine-nut trips, festivals, and communal hunts, and had authority more or less in the order listed. In addition, there was a special messenger, appointed by the chief, who invited people of other villages to cooperative enterprises. After the deaths of the other chiefs, Kuviji or Biabauwundu Pete continued as chief. He was disliked because he scolded the people every morning, but was tolerated as he was the only remaining chief. Dances were directed by Bohoa, Kuviji, and Duyumbo. Buda (arm) Jim also had a part in these. Dances were held in the spring at Biabauwundu and sometimes at Asonip, village 12, below.

Antelope hunts were directed by Tunamp, an antelope shaman, aided by Nepia and Takavi, who were probably not shamans. Antelope drives were held in March with a corral about 1 mile west of Basonip, the spring festival occurring at the same time.

Rabbit drives, held in the late fall and winter, were directed by Kajugo (Ka, ? + jugo, old man).

Mud-hen drives, which were held in Spring Valley only near Biabauwundu, as no place else had sufficient water, were directed by Jambazugo. People from other Spring Valley villages were invited to participate. Sometimes Spring Valley people communally hunted a few mud hens at Baker and Garrison in Snake Valley.

12. Basonip (ba, water + sonip, grass), a creek with a village site near the present highway, about 7 miles (?) south of Cleveland ranch. About seven families; all were killed by the white soldiers [emphasis mine].

The village chief was Yuhudumbi (yuhu, "soapy" + dumbi, rock), also called "White," director of pine-nut trips and festivals when held locally. In lieu of local festivals, Basonip people sometimes went to Deep Creek or Steptoe Valley to visit (and no doubt also to Biabauwundu).

Rabbit drives were held locally under Kinumbe, Yuhudumbi's brother.

13. Bauumba (bauu, clear + ba, water). A village near Shoshone. Probably two families. The chief may have been Ziwitci. Festival and hunting affiliations are doubtful.

In spite of the enormous height of the Snake Mountains, the greater part of its drainage runs off the eastern slope into Snake Valley, where it supported several large communities. There was sufficient water to support only three villages on the western or Spring Valley slope (pl. 3, a).

14. Basiamba (named from mountain back of Oceola, Basiandoya), village in vicinity of Oceola, a present-day [1938] mining town. About four families. Village chief, Yagatcu. Many local seeds.

15. Toziup, site on the western slope of Mount Moriah, Dadia. Two families; one that of Muvigund (muvi, nose? + gund, tall) and his four sons; the other, that of Muvigund's half brother, Konogund or Charlie. No chief.

16. Taiwudu, somewhere on the western slope of the Snake Mountains (Steward 1938:124-128).

Steward's Village 12's Location

Steward states that Village 12 is located about 7 miles south of the Cleveland Ranch. It is shown on his Figure 9 as being located on both sides of a creek that flows east into Spring Creek located in the bottom of Spring Valley. Using Google Earth and plotting a line along the highway from the Cleveland Ranch south shows Bastian Creek located at 7.46 miles. Bastian Creek is the only named creek in this area that flows east off the flank of the Shell Creek Range in a direct line toward Spring Creek and the Swamp

Cedar Natural Area. There is no doubt that Bastian Creek is a tributary of Spring Creek and a water source for the Swamp Cedar Natural Area. The El Tejon Sheep Company ranch is located on the east side of the highway on Bastian Creek.

Steward shows two springs south of Village 12. Approximately 2.5 miles south and east of this highway-ranch location is Bastian Springs which is located in the Swamp Cedar Natural Area. Another 2.5 miles south of Bastian Springs is the well known Layton Spring located on the south end of the Swamp Cedar Natural Area.

Based on the discussion and analysis above, I offer the following conclusions regarding the location of Village 12 and the two springs identified on Steward's (1938:125) Figure 9:

- Village 12 was located on Bastian Creek.
- The first spring site is Bastian Springs which is a continuation of Bastian Creek.
- The second spring site is Layton Springs.
- All three of these water locations played a key role in the human occupation and use of Spring Valley and the Swamp Cedar Natural Area.

Key Ethnographic Characteristics of Village 12

Village 12 has the following important ethnographic characteristic associated with it:

- creek running through it,
- two springs to the south,
- three pine nut gathering locations,
- seven single families,
- two festival sites; one at Village 12; one at the spring sites on the south side of Village 12,
- one antelope site,
- one mud hen drive,
- one rabbit drive location (Figure 2) (Steward 1938:125).

Village 12's Festival Connections With Other Villages

In addition to these characteristics, Steward has drawn a number of lines, with and without arrowheads, from the Festival site located at Village 12 and the Festival site located between Villages 8 and 10. Arrowheads are used by Steward to show direction and interaction between these Villages. An arrowhead on both ends of a line signifies mutual movement back and forth between the Villages. A line with a single arrowhead signifies the direction of movement, with the arrowhead being the destination.

1. A line (without arrowheads) connecting Ely, NV (Steptoe Valley) to the Festival site located at Village 12. This is most likely a major trail connecting these two valleys.
2. A line with arrowheads on both ends pointing connecting Village 12's Festival site to a Festival site located in the Steptoe Valley, about midway along the Egan Range, on Duck Creek.
3. A line with arrowhead on both ends connecting Village 12's Festival site to the Festival site located in Spring Valley between Villages 8 and 10.
4. A line from Spring Valley Villages 4, 5, 6, 9 and 7 (north end of Spring Valley) connecting with the Festival site located between Villages 8 and 10. This line only has an arrowhead at the

Festival site which means that the members of these northern villages traveled south to this Festival site. This Festival site is connected (arrowheads on both ends) to the Village 12 Festival site which links these groups to Village 12.

5. A line from the north end of Spring Valley connecting Villages 1 and 2 with the Festival site located between Villages 8 and 10. This line only has an arrowhead at the Festival site which means that the members of these northern most villages traveled south to this Festival site. This Festival site is connected (arrowheads on both ends) to the Village 12 Festival site which links these groups to Village 12.
6. A line from Village 1 and 2 in Spring Valley connecting with a Festival site at Village 17 in Antelope Valley. The line has one arrowhead at Village 17.
7. A line from Village 21 located in Antelope Valley, bisecting Village 22 (by Kern Mtns.) connecting to Village 12's Festival site (the reason the arrowhead does not touch the F is because it would obliterate Steward's notation "Mud Hen Drive." The arrowheads on both ends of this line show travel to both ways to the Festivals.
8. A line from the line connecting the Festival site located between Villages 8 and 10 and Village 12 to a Festival site located on the upper end of and east side of Deep Creek, at the base of the Deep Creek Range of Mountains. This line has a single arrowhead at Deep Creek which means that Village 12 Festival participants would travel to this Festival site in Deep Creek.
9. A line with arrowhead on both ends connecting the Festival site located between the two springs, immediately south of Village 12 to Festival location in Snake Valley at Baker, NV. This follows the trail over Sacramento Pass which crossed the Snake Range and leads to Layton Springs.
10. A line with arrowheads on both ends connecting Baker, NV with Garrison, UT. This connects Garrison, UT with Spring Valley Village 12.
11. A line with as single arrowhead connecting Big Springs Creek to Garrison, UT. This connects Big Springs Creek with Spring Valley Village 12.

Festival Sites on Steward's Figure 9

Beginning on the northwest corner of Steward's Figure 9 and moving south and east he names the following seven valleys that have festivals:

- | | |
|----------------------|--|
| • Ruby Valley; | 1 festival site; not connected to SprV or any other Festival sites. |
| • Butte Valley; | 0 festival sites; NA |
| • Steptoe Valley; | 2 festival sites; 1 bidirectional connection to SprV. |
| • Antelope Valley; | 2 festival sites; 1 bidirectional connection, 1 secondary conn. to SprV. |
| • Spring Valley; | 3 festival sites; All three located close to one another and connected. |
| • Deep Creek; | 1 festival site; 1 direct connection from SprV to Deep Cr. |
| • Snake Valley; | 2 festival sites; 1 bidirectional connection; 1 secondary connection; 1 tertiary connection. |
| Total Festival Sites | 11 |

Conclusions on the Centrality of Spring Valley and Village 12's Festival Location

Of the 11 festival sites noted by Steward:

- 10 (91%) festival sites are connected to the Spring Valley Festival sites,
- 3 (27%) Festival sites are located in a contiguous bidirectional fashion to each other in Spring Valley,
- 1 (9%) connection is direct to Deep Creek,
- 3 (27%) are bidirectional connections,
- 3 (27%) are secondary connections,
- 1 is a tertiary connection from Big Spring Creek.

The connections between the 7 (88%) Festival sites located outside of Spring Valley with the 3 Spring Valley Festival sites demonstrates that Spring Valley Festival sites played a key role in the Festivals for all of the Villages and subsistence areas of eastern Nevada. One of the Festival sites is located between Bastian Springs and Layton Spring which places it within the Swamp Cedar Natural Area. It is most likely the Festival associated with Bastian Creek is also located in or near the Swamp Cedar Natural Area. The ethnographic fact that: (1) Spring Valley has the most Festival sites (3), (2) that they are located in a contiguous fashion in or adjacent to the Swamp Cedar Natural Area, and that these 3 Festival sites are connected to 10 (91%) of the 11 other Festival sites demonstrates that Spring Valley played a central role in the production and maintenance of the Festival system of interaction in all these connected valley systems.

Winter Villages

Steward (1938:125) only identified winter villages in the Steptoe Valley at Cherry Creek, Schellbourne, Egan Canyon, Warm Springs, Duck Creek, and Ely. He goes on to state that transporting large quantities of pine nuts was difficult and they preferred to winter close to their pine nut caches (Steward 1938:28).

In Steward's (1938:ix) section titled "Explanation of Plates" he makes the following comments regarding Plate 3, a, which is a photo of Spring Valley:

Spring Valley and the eastern face of the Snake Range. The valley is entirely arid except where a few dots running out from the base of the mountains indicate the course of streams which flow but a short distance before sinking into the sands. Winter villages are located on such streams. The lower portion of the mountains is speckled with juniper and pinyon trees, the upper portion with larger pines (Steward 1938:ix).

A count of his symbol for pine nuts (Pn) on his Figure 9 on page 125 revealed that Steptoe Valley had 10 pine nut gathering locations, Spring Valley had 12 locations and Snake Valley had 3 locations.

It seems that Spring Valley had all the conditions necessary for the location of winter villages. Steward's acknowledgement of the correlation between village location and water is important when trying to predict the location of village sites (i.e., archeological or ethnographic village sites) in Spring Valley. A couple of hypotheses could be stated as follows:

1. If perennial water, then village site.
2. If perennial water and pine nut caches, then winter village site.

It is important to note, however, that where you find perennial water today is not representative of the precontact period. The Euroamerican invasion of Spring Valley and its concomitant agricultural

exploitation (e.g., irrigation, crop farming, etc.) of the valley had radically altered the pre-contact environmental context of Spring Valley.

Food Resources of Spring Valley

Pine Nuts

Pinus monophylla or pinyon or pine nut pine trees are found in Steptoe, Snake and Spring Valleys. According to Steward (1938:27), "It [pine nut] is the most important single food species where it occurs, but harvests unpredictable. Each tree yields but once in 3 or 4 years." The pine nut is harvested in September or October and the harvest period is three weeks or less. There is no ownership of pine nut areas due to the variable nature of the harvest. Sometimes families would have to travel 50 miles to find a crop of pine nuts. Needless to say, the variable nature of the pine nut harvest resulted in bringing different groups of Shoshone/Goshute people together in these three valleys (Steward 1938: 27-28). On the eastside of Spring Valley Steward identifies 6 pine nut gathering locations and on the west side of the valley he plots 6 more for a total of 12 locations in Spring Valley (Figures 2).

Steward states that Village 12 (about 7 miles south of the Cleveland ranch) is the location where "About seven families; all were killed by the white soldiers" (Steward 1938:127). The chief of Village 12 directed the pine nut gathering trips and festivals when held locally. A pine nut gathering area associated with Village 12 is located on the east side of Spring Valley and two gathering areas located west of Village 12 (Steward 1938:127). In all, 12 pine nut gathering locations, more than any contiguous valley (i.e., Steptoe or Snake Valleys), make Spring Valley a significant pine nut gathering area for the people of all three valleys:

Pine nuts were habitually gathered by the above villages [Spring Valley Villages 1–16] in localities most accessible to them or where the crop was good. There were no property rights of any kind in the pinyon groves. All families of a village traveled together to the mountains and camped together, under the direction of the village chief. In the morning the chief told each family where to gather. A family gathered only for itself and cached the nuts secretly if possible (Steward 1938:128).

According to Crum (1994:4-5), the Western Shoshone conducted prayers, ceremonies, and dances before and after the pine nut harvest. The Round Dance lasted for five days to show how much they appreciated a good harvest. The pine nut was so important to the Western Shoshone that its origin became an integral part of Shoshone oral tradition. The pine nut festival or dance also import social dimension as it was a time to identify potential mates (Crum 1994:2).

Hunting

Steward (1938) describe hunting in Spring Valley:

Hunting was carried on anywhere, there being no ownership of hunting territories. Antelope hunts were communal, under shamans who sang 5 nights. Forty or fifty men and women helped corral the animals. Deer were not shamanized. Collective hunts, in which deer were driven over cliffs, were infrequent. Mountain sheep were hunted by individual men. Buffalo disappeared when JR's grandfather was a young man. Hunting methods used for them were not known (Steward 1938:128).

Antelope

Two antelope drive locations were identified in the south end of Spring Valley (Figures 2). One is located immediately south of Village 12. The other one is near the town of Shoshoni, Nevada and Village 13. Antelope shaman directed the hunts and they were held in March. A spring festival occurred at the same time in March (Steward 1938:127). "Ely people went to Spring Valley near Cleveland [Village 11] for drives" (Steward 1938:122).

Steward (1938:33) thought that communal antelope hunting was so efficient that it would take years to restore the herd. Arkush (1999:36-37) disagrees with Steward's conclusion. He states that Steward based his conclusion on one historic account provided by Howard Egan, an early Mormon settler in the Deep Creek area.

Antelope provided large amounts of meat and marrow and other important animal products. The antelope was "a major component of Numic ceremonial systems and appear to have been one of the few group activities of Great Basin peoples that were highly ritualized (e.g. Murphy and Murphy 1986; Steward 1970a [1938])" (Arkush 1999:51-52).

Rabbit

Two locations: (1) between Villages 11 and 12 and (2) between Villages 1 and 2 (Figure 2); drives were held in the late fall and winter and were directed by Kajugo (1938:125, 127).

Mud Hens

One mud hen drive was located on the eastside of Village 12 (Figure 2). There is a line drawn by Steward from this location to a Mud Hen Drive location in Snake Valley. The arrowhead on this line is on the Snake Valley location which means they went from Spring Valley to Snake Valley to hunt.

Mud-hen drives, which were held in Spring Valley only near Biabauwundu, as no place else had sufficient water, were directed by Jambazugo. People from other Spring Valley villages were invited to participate. Sometimes Spring Valley people communally hunted a few mud hens at Baker and Garrison in Snake Valley (Steward 1938:127).

Agriculture

JR thought some horticulture had been practiced prior to the arrival of the white man, plants grown being maize, called korn, and wheat. Each family had its own garden. Men dug shallow trenches with a digging stick into which women dropped bunches of seeds at intervals and covered them with earth. JR thought all people in Snake Valley and Spring Valley had irrigated, HJ claiming the same for Ely. Farmed plots were inherited by a man's wife or children (Steward 1938:128).

Festivals/Dances

According to Steward (1938:237), festivals and festival areas, such as the 3 located in Spring Valley (Figure 2), were important determinants of social behavior.

The more important social determinates producing social cohesion in large groups were festivals, the sweat house and warfare. Kinship bonds also achieved some group solidarity. Festivals were made possible in most of the western area by the temporarily increased food supply produced by rabbit drives, pine-nut trips, antelope hunts, or other communal economic affairs. The essential motivation

for festivals, however, was noneconomic. People desired social intercourse with friends and relatives rarely seen during the remainder of the year. They wished to dance, gamble, and, in some localities hold religious observances. . . . In the Western Shoshone area festivals could be held only at times of communal hunt or when many families were gathering pine nuts or other species at a certain locality (Steward 1938:237).

The yearly cycle of the Western Shoshone was divided into four seasons consisting of spring, summer, fall and winter. The four seasons were associated with specific social, religious and economic activities. Round dances punctuated the yearly cycle with Spring dances being held for abundant plant growth, Summer dances conducted to assist with the ripening of plant growth and Fall dances were held for rabbit drives and pine nuts. Dancing was led by a respected singer. It began during the early evening and lasted until sunrise for five consecutive nights (Crum 1994:8).

Western Shoshone people conducted prayers, ceremonies, and dances before and after the pine nut harvest. They danced the Round Dance for five days to demonstrate their appreciation for a successful harvest. The pine nut was such a significant food resource for the Western Shoshone that its origin became part of their oral tradition (Steward 1938:45). The pine nut festival was an important time to find potential mates (Crum 1994:2).

Steward (1938:122) states that “Festivals, involving the round dance . . . were held, usually after pine-nut harvest, at various localities, depending partly upon the abundance of seeds.” The round dance also “was thought to incidentally bring rain, crop fertility, or general well-being” (Steward 1938:45). “Dances were preformed only at festivals which were held annually or at most two to three times a year when a large crowd foregathered for a brief period” (Steward 1938:45).

Crum (1994:40-41) points out that the round dance was renamed by Euroamericans in the 1860s at which time they came to be called *fandangos*, a Spanish word for celebration or dance. Over time, the Shoshone accepted the term *fandango* and the dances began to include a much larger gathering of Shoshone beyond the former subsistence area congregation. Fandangos became associated with events like July 4th and other Euroamerican activities. They were used as a mechanism to communicate with other tribal groups and Euroamericans. Today the *fandango* is a Shoshone cultural event with the addition of new elements (Crum 1994:60).

The Gosiute Shoshone held festivals principally in the spring of the year. They danced the Round Dance for five days to make the seeds grow. Dances were held at other times during the year and most especially during the pine nut gathering in the fall (Steward 1938:139). Steward (1938:130) points out that Snake Valley residents attended festivals in Spring Valley (see Figure 2).

“In the early post-Caucasian times dances with local leaders might be held . . . at Cleveland [Ranch Spring Valley Village 11], where Gosiute sometimes attended . . . (Steward 1938:122-123).

Steward’s Figure 9 on page 125 shows three closely spaced Festival sites: (1) Village 12 has one festival associated with it, (2) the spring sites south of Village 12 has one festival site and (3) the third festival site appears to be between Villages 8 and 10 (Figure 2).

Pottery

Pottery was not used much by the Great Basin groups because they preferred lightweight basketry which was better suited to the mobile lifestyle of hunter and gatherers (Crum 1994:9).

Spiritual Belief System

According to Crum (1994:9), Western Shoshone were very religious and spiritual. Both men and women were spiritual or medicine people, who could conduct healing ceremonies, lead the prayers at pine nut harvests, antelope drives and Round Dances. The Shoshone were aware of their dependence on the environment for survival and had a deep respect for the land and all living things (1994:9). The pre-contact residents of Spring Valley believed that all things had a spiritual base. Animism is the term used by anthropologists to describe this belief system. This belief system was manifest in their Festival behavior and by the fact that they had spiritual leaders which directed certain subsistence activities (e.g., pine nut gathering, rabbit and antelope hunts).

Culturally Significant Ethnographic Conclusions

Steward's (1938) ethnographic work in Spring Valley unequivocally documents several culturally significant ethnographic conclusions about Spring Valley:

- Western Shoshone/Goshute peoples occupied Spring Valley before and after the time of the Euroamerican invasion of the area.
- Steward's (1938) 16 village locations document a significant number and type of subsistence activities in the valley.
- Spring Valley was used intensively and extensively and represented a significant economic resource area to its occupants. Twelve pine nut gathering locations, antelope, deer, rabbit and mud hen hunting locations clearly documents the economic significance of the valley to the economy of its occupants.
- The spiritual and religious practices associated with the subsistence activities define Spring Valley as a culturally significant spiritual and religious area.
- The pre-contact occupants of the valley were animists who believed that all things had a spiritual base.
- The presence of this belief system in Spring Valley is evidenced in the presence of 3 closely spaced Festival sites, more than any other contiguous valley.
- The ethnographic fact that the 3 festival sites in Spring Valley have more connections to the surrounding Snake and Steptoe valleys document that significant cultural and religious activities were associated with these Spring Valley Festival sites and their associated villages.
- Festivals/fandangos are socioreligious events where they prayed, danced and gave thanks to the spirits to show their appreciation for a bountiful harvest.
- The fact that they had spiritual directors for specific subsistence activities (e.g., rabbit and antelope hunts, pine nut gathering) also documents that this spiritual belief system was practiced in Spring Valley.
- This integration of the spiritual and the physical in these cultures makes it impossible to separate religion and resource procurement. Festivals were a celebration of the two worlds combined.

- The whole of these various economic and religious activities document that Spring Valley was a significant cultural and traditional use area for the Western Shoshone/Goshute.
- Being located between Steptoe and Snake Valleys, Spring Valley played a significant economic and cultural role (i.e., central) in the interactions of the various cultural groups of all three valleys—Steptoe, Spring and Snake.

EUROAMERICAN INVASION OF THE AREA

1859 Simpson Invades Spring Valley

Captain J. H. Simpson was asked to find a shorter route from Camp Floyd (near Fairfield, Utah) to California. He was to complete this expedition in three months and his party of 63 departed Camp Floyd on May 2, 1859 (Mathis 1959:94-95).

Simpson noted in his journal on May 11, 1859, that they had spent a night at Camp No. 9 which was located on the east slope of Antelope Valley. The next day they were to head west and cross Antelope and Shell valleys, respectively. In his journal he states:

In the vicinity where we cross it there are no indications of water or grass, but some 50 miles to the south of us, to the north of our return-route, there is water and an abundance of grass. After crossing Antelope Valley, you ascend a rather low range of mountains, composed slaty, stratified rocks, by a tolerable grade, and get into a shallow valley, called Shell Valley on account of being covered with shale. Crossing this you descend over a formations of dioritic rocks, in 2 miles, by a good grade, into Spring Valley, where there is an extensive bottom of alkaline grass and of spring water, and where we encamp early in the afternoon. Journey, 19 miles, road generally good. . . . **It is called Spring Valley, from the number of springs which make a chain of small shallow lakes or ponds in the direction of its length** [emphasis mine]. The grass in it is abundant, but coarse and alkaline. Better grass can be found in the ravines and on the bench on the west side of the valley. . . . Found some Root-Diggers here [which he later refers to as “Go-Shoot”] (Simpson 1876:55-56).

On Simpson's return trip to Camp Floyd he followed a route located south of his west route. Simpson established Camp 21 on Stevenson's Creek in the Steptoe Valley on July 18, 1859. His notes state that about a mile after they found the Mormon road they crossed a creek that Simpson named after Captain Carter L. Stevenson. Shortly after crossing then newly named Stevenson Creek they left the Mormon road and continued on to Camp 21. While traveling to Camp 21 Simpson noted an arch through which he could see blue sky. The party crossed the summit of the Shell Creek Range on July 19th and descended into what Simpson called Antelope Valley [actually Spring Valley] through a Little Canyon which he named after Captain Henry Little. “Thence 6.6 miles, or about two-thirds of the way across Antelope Valley [Spring], to some springs, which, by being opened, may be made to serve a large command. We encamped [Camp No. 22] at these springs at 2.15” (Simpson 1876:118-119).

Camp No. 22, located 50 miles south of Camp 9, is the camp site that Simpson was referring to on May 11, 1859, when they were camped in Antelope Valley. The following are important comments by Simpson about Antelope Valley [Spring]:

Antelope Valley [Spring], in which we are camped, exhibits a much better soil in this portion of it than where we crossed it on our outward route. To the north, commencing about three-quarters of a mile from our camp, a bottom of good grass (a great deal of it red-top), 2 or 3 miles wide, extends for a distance of 8 or 10 miles northwardly, and

probably further, and **intermingled with it are extensive groves of tall cedars** [emphasis mine], which thus far on our routes, existing, **as these groves do, in the bottom of the valley, is quite an anomaly** [emphasis mine]. Birds frequent these groves, and make the air, resonant with their music. The scenery, too, is quite pretty (Simpson 1876: 120).

It is my opinion, based on Simpson’s comments above, and the location of Camp 22 on his map, that Camp 22 was located at or near Layton Spring. A Google Earth measurement from Layton Spring to the nearest cedars shows they are located one mile north of the spring. I have visited Layton Spring and agree with Simpson’s astute characterization of the cedar groves as being “**quite an anomaly.**”

1860-1861: The Pony Express and Overland Mail Invasion

Pony Express service commenced on April 3, 1860. A year later in October of 1861, a telegraph station was placed at Ibapah, Utah (aka Deep Creek). The advent of the telegraph put an end the Pony Express in that area of Utah and Nevada (Bateman 1984:18). The Pony Express Trail through these valleys began at Lehi, Utah and ended in Ruby Valley, Nevada. The Pony Express route crossed the northern end of Spring Valley near Shellbourne.

Howard Egan’s diary (1917:197-198) outlined the Overland Mail Route and it generally followed the Pony Express Trail.

Miles	Station Name	Miles	Station Name
0	Salt Lake City	10	Boyd’s
9	Traveler’s Rest	10	Willow Springs (Callao)
11	Rockwell’s	15	Canyon Station
9	Dug Out	12	Deep Creek (Ibapah)
10	Ft. Crittenden/Floyd	8	Prairie Gate or Eight Mile
10	Pass	18	Antelope Spring
10	Rush Valley	13	Spring Valley
11	Point Lookout	12	Schell Creek
15	Simpson’s Springs	12	Egan Canyon
8	River Bed	15	Butte
10	Dug Way	11	Mountain Springs
12	Black Rock	9	Ruby Valley
11	Fish Springs		

Military Invasion of the Area

March 1, 1860: General Johnston Ordered to Leave Camp Floyd

There is some disagreement among certain authors as to the date when General Johnston departed from Utah and the closing of Camp Floyd (cf., Bateman 1984, Wilson 2005, 1910, Angle 1881, Mathis 1959). According to Mathis (1959), on January 11, 1860, General Johnston received orders that released him from the Department of Utah and he was the first soldier to leave Utah under this order. Johnston turned his command over to Colonel Smith on January 29, 1860. He left Camp Floyd for California on March 1, 1860. By May 1860, three months after his departure, the force, consisting of officers and men, was reduced from 2,227 to 284 soldiers (Mathis 1959:124-125).

Summer/Fall 1860

Colonel Smith ordered Lieutenant Delavan D. Perkins on May 25, 1860 to go to Ruby Valley to protect the Simpson mail and emigrant route during the summer of 1860. Twenty-three men under the command of Lieutenant Stephen H. Weed arrived on June 10, 1860 in Ruby Valley. The remainder of the troops under the command of Lieutenant Perkins arrived in Ruby Valley on June 13, 1860. Colonel Smith only had 48 men left at Camp Floyd (Mathis 1959:130-131).

Weed and others related the following incidents during the summer of 1860: (1) August 6, 1860: supply train attacked near Antelope Springs, (2) August 11, Egan Canyon: Pony Express rider informs Weed that the station had been threatened and a battle occurred, (3) patrol engaged in an action in Spring Valley and Deep Creek, (4) three soldiers returning from Deep Creek to Shell Creek had an encounter with the Indians, (5) September 6, 1860: the last incident was near Deep Creek. Soldiers continued to guard the route until October 5, 1860 when they returned to Camp Floyd (Mathis 1959:133-136).

August 20, 1860 Cooke Assumes Command of Camp Floyd

Colonel Philip St. George Cooke assumed command of Camp Floyd on August 20, 1860. He ordered all units to return to Camp Floyd. The last unit returned on October 6, 1860. On February 6, 1861, Cooke renamed Camp Floyd to Fort Crittenden (Mathis 1959: 139, 141- 42).

July 27, 1861: Fort Crittenden Abandoned

Colonel Cooke received Special Order 86½ dated May 17, 1861 which ordered the immediate abandonment of the fort. The last action by the soldiers of the newly named Ft. Crittenden occurred between May 19 and June 19, 1861. This detachment was sent to protect the mail route and the records of this action have been lost (Mathis 1959: 139, 141- 42).Cooke ordered the detachment to return from Ft. Ruby. This detachment arrived at Ft. Crittenden on June 19, 1861. The soldiers began dismantling the fort and on July 27, 1861 the Army left Utah, arriving in Washington, D.C. on October 19, 1861(Mathis 1959:165-166).

Reasons for Indian-Euroamerican Conflict

According to Bateman (1984:83-84), the invasion of the area by the overland mail route in the 1860s, with its contingent of soldiers, was probably the main source of conflict between the Indians and the invading Euroamericans. The original mail route had been started using mules, and from 1860 to 1861 the Pony Express, using horses, operated over this same trail. This early use of the trail by mules and the Pony Express did not seem to be a major source of conflict.

Bateman (1984:74) states that from the point of view of the Indians, their homelands were experiencing more and more invasion by the Euroamericans. Traditional food sources were disappearing and the stations and farms were being built near water and fish sources and the game was being driven away or killed by the newcomers. The U. S. Government was also unreliable with its support to the Indian farm and with other promises that had been made. Bateman concludes by saying:

From the Indians' viewpoint, their fragile home was being encroached upon more and more frequently. Their natural food supply was disappearing. Stations and farms were built near water and fish sources. Game was driven away or killed by the settlers and emigrants. The government was not consistent with the Indian farm or other promises made to them. It was easier to steal and plunder from the whites and seemed very justifiable. Misjustice (sic) was returned in like manner (Bateman 1984:74).

Violence that had occurred in northern Nevada along the Humboldt River area began to occur in central Nevada along the Pony Express Trail in 1861. These hostilities resulted in the established Fort Ruby by the federal government in 1862. The fort commander was Colonel Patrick E. Conner of the California Volunteers who ordered his troops to hunt down the Western Shoshone and kill them indiscriminately (Crum 1991:23-24).

Overland mail agent, Hiram Rumfield, made the following comments about the invasion of the Euroamerican and their impact on the traditional food supply of the Indians during the summer of 1862:

About a mile above the house in which I write [Egan's] is a large Indian encampment. As game of all kinds had left the valley since the Overland Mail Company established its route along here, the poor savages have had no means of subsistence, except that furnished by the Company. We have fed them liberally, acting upon the principal that it is cheaper to feed than to fight them. Last quarter we paid Mr. Egan 1792 dollars for beef furnished these Indians and his bill for the present quarter will scarcely be less (Bateman 1984:77-78).

The express company's presence in the area increased dramatically by 1865. Along this trail area from Salt Lake City to Austin, Nevada, they had 22 drivers, 60 wagons, 36 stations and 190 horses. Deep Creek Station had become a major overnight and supply station for the express company. This prosperity ended abruptly when the transcontinental railroad was completed on May 10, 1869 by the Union Pacific and the Central Pacific at Promontory Point, Utah (Bateman 1984:84-85).

According to Crum (1994:31), by the early 1870s the Shoshone of Spring Valley were tending small subsistence gardens. Numbers of Shoshone were employed as laborers for the Euroamericans; men worked as cowboys and hay cutters and the women worked as servants.

SPRING VALLEY ETHNOHISTORICAL SOURCES

Below is a presentation of additional ethnohistorical and ethnographic literature pertaining to Spring Valley. Only those texts with passages germane to a discussion of conflict and massacre sites have been cited. Do not expect any fluid narrative transition between the materials presented below. I have clarified and interpreted certain statements.

Ronald R. Bateman 1984

The following historical events quoted from Bateman (1984:18-20) are relevant to the history of Spring Valley:

- 1858 Territorial Legislature granted the valley of Ibapah to Brigham Young in January.
- 1859 Indian farm and settlement began at Deep Creek by Harrison Severe, Wilford Hudson and James Worthington in the spring.
- 1860 Indians killed mail station livestock at Deep Creek on March 5.
Pony Express service began on April 3.
T. R. Miller killed by Indians at Ibapah on May 28.
Willow Springs Station was attacked in June.
Antelope Springs Station was burned in June.
Three men were wounded at Deep Creek in July.

- Indians and whites skirmish near Deep Creek on August 12th and 13th.
General store opened by Howard Egan at Ibapah.
- 1861 Indians threaten Deep Creek and Willow Springs in March.
The Civil War begins and Johnston's army was called east to fight in May.
Butterfield's Overland Mail took over the mainline west of Salt Lake in July.
Canyon station was in operation.
Soldiers and Indians battled near Deep Creek in September.
A telegraph station was placed at Ibapah in October.
- 1862 Third California Volunteers under Colonel Patrick Edward Connor march through on their way to Salt Lake.
- 1863 Indians attacked at Eightmile Station on March 22nd.
Stage driver, W. R. Simpson, killed near Canyon Station on May 19th.
Canyon Station burned and occupants massacred on July 8th.
Gosiute Treaty signed on October 12.
- 1865 Deep Creek Reservation put up for sale.
- 1869 Overland stage through Ibapah ended with completion of the transcontinental railroad.
- 1875 An Indian scare turned out to be mostly false rumors (Bateman1984:18-20).

Bateman's Spring Valley Incidents

The following is quoted from Bateman (1984:73):

On August 12, 1860 . . . Additional Indian attacks came at Spring Valley in Nevada and Schell Creek (Shellbourne, Nevada) stations, and seventeen Indians were killed.²⁵
[Wilson, op. cit., pp. 152-155.]²⁵ Ibid., August 12, 1860: Drake, op.cit., p. 139 (Bateman 1984:73).

The following is quoted from Bateman (1984:74):

*A major Indian battle was described in detail by Nick Wilson, a pony express rider, which supposedly happened in about the time frame being presented. He alleged that 300 to 350 warriors and their wives were slaughtered by Johnston's army in a west desert raid. The report is unsubstantiated by any reliable source, even though it would have been considered a major battle of the time and is mentioned cautiously in his history.

However, there was reportedly a whole Indian encampment wiped out by soldiers in Spring Valley, Nevada on the Cleveland Ranch site, according to the Goshute Albert McGill. His grandmother was among those killed. The place was called Bird Creek. This may have been the battle referred to by a Nick Wilson. [emphasis mine] (See also Patsy's brief account in Chapter Nine concerning an Indian massacre by soldiers.)²⁷
[²⁷ Bill West in personal correspondence to the author; handwritten not found in Chloe Parrish papers; Wilson, op. cit., pp. 152-155 (Bateman 1984:91).] Another source has this to say:

We had many Field Trips in search of the battlegrounds reported in the old book, *The White Indian Boy*. . . After searching from South Trout Creek to the north of Callao, . . . Betty Sims reported to be that she heard tell of many bones of

Indians found in Pleasant Valley, many years ago. Grandma Pearlene Henroid is a living witness to this story. My Indian Friend from Ibapah . . . said they were buried in a big wash enmass by the Army. It is dated in the late summer of 1859! Why does the Utah and Nevada state line pass laterally through this gully? (From undated typescript at Utah State Historical Society. Author unknown.) (Bateman 1984:74).

Bateman (1984:444) states:

Patsy and Muggins were an old Indian couple (see photo in Chapter 6) that worked for Charles and Tillie Felt. Patsy told the Felts a story of how the government ordered General Connor to go out through the country and kill all the Indians he came in contact with. His company made a surprise attack on some in Spring Valley, Nevada or near there. One soldier grabbed a baby out of Patsy's arms and killed it by hitting its head on a tree stump.¹⁰ Bateman (1984:444) [¹⁰Chloe Parrish papers; Bill West communication." Bateman (1984:483).

Bateman's Chronology of Conflict in Spring Valley

1860

By April 1860, the combination stage and pony express stations had been abandoned due to attacks by the Indians. The territorial governor of Utah sends a cavalry unit of 92 men to protect the mail route (Bateman 1984:72).

1863

The last major raid in the Deep Creek vicinity occurred in July 1863. It was in response to a massacre by Conner's soldiers at a peaceful Indian encampment near Simpson Springs. The scouting party of soldiers killed the entire groups of Indians which were in camp. Many of the Indian men were away hunting. The chief (Pianum) returned the evening of the massacre with some of his braves to find their families and friends slain. Even though this group of Indians had been friendly to the whites, they couldn't overlook this gruesome act. The chief traveled west and recruited his wife's Gosiute relatives to help with revenge. . . . they decided to attack Canyon Station . . . (Bateman 1984:80).

Doc Faust sheds additional light on the motive for the Indians' attack on Canyon Station:

I was living at Rush Valley station when Capt. Smith with his company came to Rockwell's ranch and camped. For some cause or another, they surrounded (?) and killed the men, women and children of a little encampment of friendly Indians that were camped in the cedars nearby. The soldiers only saved one— that was Peanum's young squaw. Capt. Smith took her to his own tent, where I saw her when I went over to see what was going on. She told me that he made her sleep with him and she begged me most piteously to take her away. I talked with Smith, and he told me that he was holding her in order that she should tell where the rest of the Indians were. I told her what he said. She replied that she knew of no other Indians, only her husband and some of his brothers, who had gone hunting, and she did not know where they were then (?). I will never forget the poor women as I left, crying as though her heart could break. It afterwards transpired that Smith kept her as long as he wanted her, and then sent Spanish Joe off with her. She was afterwards found with a bullet through her head. I visited the dead Indian's camp and

found the Indians unburied. I recognized the father and brother of Peanum. It was a ghastly sight. They were all swollen to twice their natural size– one mother hugging her little papoose (sic) to her breast as tight as though she would shield it from the destroyer. There are more savages than the Indians (Bateman 1984:92)!

Rush Valley Station, commonly called Faust’s Station, was the first home station west of Salt Lake City for the Pony riders. The following is quoted from a chapter in History of Tooele County Volume II written by Ouida Blanthorn:

“By using his skills and medical knowledge for the benefit of the Indians, Henry became known as “Doc” Faust, and the station as Faust Station, rather than Rush Valley Station. He homesteaded 160 acres of meadowland and established a fine ranch, bringing in thoroughbred stock from Canada. This ranch was later sold to Orrin Porter Rockwell, ... (Sons of Utah Pioneers)....” (<http://www.xphomestation.com/utsta.html#RUSH>, 8/7/2010).

Elijah Nicolas Wilson 1910, 2005

1860-1861

Nicolas Wilson was employed as rider for the Pony Express from 1860 to 1861. Initially, he was stationed at Ruby Valley, Nevada and later Shell Creek. He rode from his home station at Shell Creek to Deep Creek (Wilson and Wilson 2005:85).

1861 Spring Valley

In the spring of 1861, Wilson returned to the Shell Creek Station and rode the trail from it west to Ruby Valley. On one of his other trips, he stopped at the Spring Valley station for dinner. While eating dinner he noticed two Indians chasing station horses toward the cedars. He shot at them with his pistol but missed. He followed them into the cedars and was hit in the head with a “flint-spiked” arrow. They removed the shaft from the point but could not get the point out of his head at that time. The point was removed later and he returned to work. During this time period, he points out that the conflict in this area of the Pony Express route area had increased dramatically with stations burned, emigrant trains attacked, horses stolen, and riders killed (Wilson and Wilson 2005:89-90).

Wilson’s First Hand Account of a Battle/Massacre by General Johnston

Wilson has a chapter in his book titled “Johnston Punishes the Indians.” According to Wilson (2005:7) the soldiers stationed at Camp Floyd, under the command of General Johnston, received orders to stop the conflict along the stage route. Wilson was to act as Johnston’s guide and interpreter. Wilson captured and two Indians and took them to Fish Springs to talk with General Johnston (Wilson and Wilson 2005: 97-98). Wilson acted as the interpreter and Johnston talked with one of them for about an hour. The following paragraph is taken from Wilson’ 1910 publication and has been deleted from the 2005 Wilson and Wilson publication.

General Johnston talked with the Indians for about an hour, and I [Wilson] acted as interpreter. Yaiabi told him just how the big the camp of Indians was located, and said there were about three hundred warriors there then; they were looking for about fifty more to join him that night, and as soon as they could complete their plans they were going to burn the stations and kill all the white men they could find. He thought they would be ready in about five days to begin their bloody work (Wilson 1910:177).

Wilson was sent ahead of the main party to make sure the Indians were camped at this lake. He knew this area well and estimated that it would take a hard night's ride from this spring to reach the lake. Wilson described the lake as being 1.5 miles long by 0.5 mile wide. Wilson, being familiar with the Shoshone language, wrapped himself in a blanket and walked into the Indian camp. He began conversing with one Indian who said that he and 17 others of the Pocatello group had just arrived. In four days they would burn the stations and kill everything they could. The Pocatello Indians and Gosiutes would start at Ibapah go east and the Parowans would head west to Ruby Valley (Wilson and Wilson 2005:99-100).

As soon as Johnston arrived, Wilson took him to a high point above the lake so he could view the Indian camp. During his observation of the camp, he questioned Wilson about a patch of willows on the west side of the camp. Wilson responded in the affirmative by saying he knew it very well. The reason he had such an intimate knowledge of this willow patch was because the Pony Express had a station where the Indian camp was located and that he, as a rider for the Pony Express, had been to this station many times.

While it was still dark, Johnston troops surrounded the camp and the battle commenced at sun rise. Wilson says he did not assist in battle because Johnston said his responsibilities were restricted to only being a scout. It took about two hours for the soldiers to kill every Indian, men, women and children and dogs. Wilson related that it was the last one he had ever seen and by far the worst. That spring, the Civil War began and General Johnston went back east (Wilson and Wilson 2005:100-103).

Wilson's discussion of battle/massacre incident by General Johnston conflicts with previous author's dates. Mathis says Johnston left Utah on March 1, 1860, a month before the Pony Express began providing services. Bateman says the Pony Express went into service on April 3, 1860 that service ended in October of 1861, when a telegraph station was established at Ibapah, Utah. Wilson's last sentence which refers to "That spring" would have been next spring after the massacre. If Wilson's "That spring" refers to 1860 when Johnston left Utah, the massacre would have occurred in 1859. This is before he rode for the Pony Express.

Thompson and West 1881

Thompson and West provide ethnohistorical information on the conflict between Indians and the Euroamericans who invaded Spring Valley. Some of this information may be similar to what other authors have said above.

1863: Goshute War

According to Angel (1881:180), the Goshute War Chief White Horse killed the Overland Stage Company operator of the Eight Mile Station. The Chief and his group then hid in the station waiting for the stage to arrive. When it arrived, the Indians fired upon it and the driver, "Happy Harry," was mortally wounded as well as the man sitting next to him had been hit with an arrow. A passenger climbed out of the coach, and took the reins, drove stage to the Deep Creek Station. Angel says this event which occurred on March 22, 1863, started the Goshute War of 1863.

Days later major hostilities occurred along the 225-mile trail from Shell Creek to Salt Lake City. On March 25, 1863, three days after the incident, Captain S. P. Smith left Camp Douglas, Utah (located on the present day University of Utah campus) with Company K., Second California Cavalry Volunteers and headed for Eight Mile Station. This detachment made it to Fort Ruby by the end of April. On May 5, 1863 Company E, Third California Infantry Volunteers left Camp Douglas with orders to protect the Overland Stage road from Salt Lake City to Austin. A few infantry men left at each station and they would ride the stage from one station to next and back. Cavalry troops scouted the area and patrolled the route. One night

a stage was attacked by Indians when it passed through a canyon just east of Shell Creek (Angel 1881:180).

1863, March 23: Canon Station Battle

Near the Nevada state line is a dry station called Canon Station. On March 23, 1863, the day after Happy Harry had been killed; the Indians burned Canon Station, drove off the stock and killed the Canon Station operator. Four infantry soldiers of Company E had been left at this station to protect it. Three of them were attacked by 18 Indians while getting water and two were killed (Angle 1881:181-182).

1863, May 4: Duck Creek Battle

The Indian Agent at Ft. Ruby, Henry Butterfield, had employed two Shoshone Indian scouts to find out which Indians had killed the stage keeper at the Eight Mile station. These scouts returned with information that the Goshutes had killed him. On May 1, 1863, Captain S. P. Smith and his Cavalry Volunteers were dispatched to Shell Creek. The next morning they arrived at Shell Creek, 60 miles east of Ft. Ruby, and made to wait for their Shoshone scouts. That evening the scouts returned and informed Captain Smith a number of Goshute were camped about 10 miles south of them on Duck Creek. Smith left his camp and traveled the 10 miles in the dark to be in a position to attack the Indians at sunrise. They attacked the warriors at sunrise and killed 24 of them. Two escaped into the hills. Smith and his men camped near the "scene of the massacre" until next day assuming that the other Indians belonging to this group would return. He camped where Duck Creek opens into Steptoe Valley and was in front of the historic Caldwell House. Five Goshutes returned to the Indian camp about 2:00 pm that day and all were killed by the Cavalry (Angel 1881:181).

1863, May 6: Spring Valley Battle

On May 5, 1863, Captain Smith and Company K crossed the divide that separates Duck Creek from Steptoe Creek, marched east, and crossed the Shell Creek Range and reached Spring Valley at daylight on morning of the "sixteenth" of May, 1863.

Here they surprised another **Indian camp in a cedar swamp, south of the present Cleveland ranch. The cavalry charged down upon the hostile band, but were brought to a halt by the swampy character of the ground. Many horses were mired, but some floundered through, and the consequent confusion, with temporary delay, enabled most of the Indians to escape** [emphasis mine]. Twenty-three were found dead after the short, sharp conflict which ensued. The casualty to the whites was a soldier wounded and one horse disabled (Angel 1881:181).

After this battle, Captain Smith returned to Ft. Ruby on May 10, 1863 and reported that 52 Goshutes had been dispatched. The date of this last entry is confusing. It is not possible to arrive in Spring Valley on May 16th and returned to Fort Ruby on May 10. Most likely the author meant to say on the "sixth" of May, not the "sixteenth."

1863, July 6: Canon Station Incident #2

On July 6, 1863, Canon Station was again being protected by four soldiers, the station operator and his assistant. During this second attack all six men were killed by the Indians. Company K, stationed at Deep Creek pursued these Indians but was unable to find them (Angel 1881:182).

1875 Spring Valley and the Eastern Nevada War Panic

The next confrontation between the Indians and invading Euroamericans in Spring Valley occurred in 1875. Two Goshute Indians lead two white men to believe that they knew the location of a valuable mine. They all agreed to a fee of \$50.00 for the Goshutes to take the white men to its location. When the white men found that the mine was worthless they refused to pay the \$50.00 to the Goshute. The Indians killed one of the men and the other one escaped and made it to the Cleveland Ranch in Spring Valley. Cleveland captured one of the Indians with the intent of turning him over to the authorities. Mr. Cleveland, however, shot the Indian when he tried to escape. Cleveland's ranch hands met up with another Indian and shot him when he refused to give them his gun (Angle 1881:183).

At the time of the incident discussed above, a large number of Goshutes were already present in Spring Valley for their fall (September/October) gathering of pine nuts. The Goshutes assembled in the valley were alarmed by the killing of two of their fellow Goshutes. This large presence of Goshutes in Spring Valley for the collection of pine nuts was misunderstood by the local Euroamericans living in the area and thought the Goshute had gathered to declare on them. Major John H. Dennis was dispatched from Eureka, Nevada for Spring Valley on September 6, 1875. He was to rescue Mr. Cleveland who was reported to have been besieged at his ranch. The Goshutes met with Major Dennis as soon as he got to Spring Valley. They stated their reason for being in Spring Valley was only to collect pine nuts and they had no intention of going to war. The Goshute who killed one of the white men associated with mine incident was turned over to the soldiers and hung by local citizens. According to Angel (1881:181) this incident ended the last "Indian war" in Nevada.

Carlin Malouf 1940

As a graduate student in the Department of Anthropology at the University of Utah, Carling Malouf completed a Master's thesis in 1940 titled *A Study of the Goshute Indians of Utah*. His thesis is particularly relevant to this study because it combines important ethnohistorical information with ethnographic field data collected from Goshute consultants on the Goshute Reservation. His thesis documents that when he did his fieldwork (prior to 1940), there were Goshute consultants who had knowledge of a massacre that took place in Spring Valley. Malouf's research demonstrates that, at that time, there was continuity in the belief system with regard to a massacre Spring Valley. Relevant portions of his thesis are quoted below.

Malouf on Wilson's Massacre of 350 Indians by General Johnston

Malouf (1940:101-101) cites Wilson 1910 publication and his discussion of the massacre of 350 Indians by General Johnston. Malouf was not able to verify that this battle was fought and makes the following comments in this regard:

A battle of this magnitude was fought north of the Great Salt Lake, but this one was at Fish Springs, in the desert domain. They were camped near Fish Springs preparing for a campaign which would have resulted in the burning of a Pony Express and Stage Station, and the killing of all white men possible. The Utes, said to be "Parowahs," were to go to Ruby Valley, and Pocatello's band and the Gosiute were suppose to start at Ibapah and burn eastward. Two companies from Camp Floyd succeeded in surprising the Indians and the impending raid was thwarted (Malouf 1940:100-101).

Malouf's description of the location of this massacre is different than the one described above by Wilson. According to Wilson, the soldiers were camped at Fish Springs (see pg. 15 above for locations) and the hostile Indians were located west of it along the stage route.

Conner's Men Massacre Friendly Indians at Coyote's Spring

Malouf (1940:101-102) says a group of soldiers stationed at Simpson Springs killed some friendly Indians camped at Coyote's Spring (six miles south of Simpson's Spring). This camp of friendly Indians was led by a Pahvant Ute named Peahnamp who was married to a Deep Creek Gosiute. These soldiers, without orders, attacked the camp while Peahnamp was gone. Upon his return, he found that they all had been killed.¹²⁸ [“¹²⁸ Complied from Egan (1917:263-264), and Sharp and Bennion (1936:92-93). The latter writers claim that Peahnamp heard the cries of the wounded in camp and that the soldiers even tried to kill him.”] This massacre ended his friendship with the whites. To seek revenge, Peahnamp and others attacked the Canyon Station and killed about five or six men and one man escaped.

Malouf's description of the massacre at Coyote's Spring appears to be the same one described above by Doc Faust (pg. 20) when he was living in Rush Valley, Utah.

Malouf Confirms Goshute's Memory of Indians Massacred in Spring Valley

Malouf (1940:103-104) states:

The Indians still have their versions of some of these incidents, although they seem to follow a general pattern. The events they describe are relatively recent and they have some basis of historical fact, but whether they may be attributed to the period of the Army at Camp Floyd, or to a later period during the Civil War, is unknown. At any rate they reflect one main attitude, that the Gosiute, not involved in depredations, should not have been punished for the offenses of others. Here are two examples of their stories [only one is about Spring Valley].

Many years ago the people in Spring Valley were having a Circle Dance. In those days it was not part of the Bear Dance as it is now. One of this group, unknown to others had stolen a horse from soldiers in Steptoe Valley, so these soldiers, guided by a Nevada Shoshoni, went into the camp in Spring Valley and killed everyone in it. Then they returned to Elko, Nevada. Later some Gosiute went to the camp and found everyone dead. One man lying on his back had a number of bruises on his body. These had been caused by bullets because the man was so tough they could not pierce his skin. He had to be killed by choking him, and several soldiers were required to subdue him (Malouf 1940:103-104).

Southern Paiute Oral History of Indians Massacred in Spring Valley

LaVan Martineau published a text in 1991 titled *The Southern Paiutes Legends Lore Language and Lineage*. While conducting his fieldwork with Paiute consultants, two of them made oral statements about Indians being massacred in Spring Valley. His research documents two important ethnographic facts: (1) that the memory of Indians being massacred in Spring Valley known and remembered by the Paiute and (2) that the knowledge of Indians being massacred in Spring Valley is not restricted to the Goshute. The following quotes are taken from his text.

Indians Massacred at Spring Valley: Indian Peak 24

Indian Peak 24 is the reference Martineau uses to identify the consultant who provided the following oral description of the massacre:

One time some Indians from Parowan, Utah and some Gosiutes were camping together in Spring Valley, near the present town of Baker, Nevada. The white man had killed some horses belonging to the ranchers and the Indians were blamed. Soldiers then crept upon the encampment hoping to surprise it when an Indian spotted them and shouted the alarm. There wasn't enough time to prepare or flee. One Indian mother threw her blanket over her daughter and covered it with dirt hoping the soldiers wouldn't find her. The soldiers massacred everyone including women and children. Later on the girl lifted up the blanket and saw that everyone had been killed. She was old enough to know what happened and later tell other Indians about it (Martineau 1992:59-60).

Martineau's footnote to this quote is number 37:

³⁷ E. N. Wilson who wrote the book *The White Indian Boy* and who participated in the massacre says it happened just before the Civil War (Wilson 1919) (sic). A Nevada book gives the date as May 6, 1863 for this massacre, when 23 Indians were killed (Martineau 1992:59).

Based on the ethnohistorical literature presented above, these two sentences do not refer to the same time period. Wilson does not say it happened in Spring Valley he only refers to it occurring at a Pony Express station. According to Mathis, Johnston left Utah on March 1, 1860.

Martineau's mention of the "Nevada book" is probably Angel's 1881 *History of Nevada*. In Angel's text he stated that Captain Smith was in Spring Valley on May 6, 1863. Most of the Indians escaped but 23 were killed. Wilson's massacre mentions over 300 Indians being killed.

Indians Massacred at Spring Valley and Elsewhere: Eagle Valley 2

Eagle Valley 2 is the reference Martineau uses to identify the consultant who provided the following oral description of the massacre:

Juicy (Josey) Point (Poench?), wife of George Point, from Ibapah, Utah, was my uncle's wife. One time when she was just a little girl, soldiers dressed in blue uniforms, caps, and stripes, attacked her people in Spring Valley, Nevada (between Baker and Ely). They were camped by a tree and a ditch. The soldiers killed everyone, even ladies and little kids. They wanted the land. Juicy's mother told Juicy to run and hide. She ran down the ditch and up the hill to the top of the mountain. The mountain has a point on it where she ran. She always used to tell me this story when I visited her (Martineau 1992:60).

SPRING VALLEY MASSACRE AND/OR BATTLE SITES ANALYSIS

Based on the ethnohistorical and ethnographic literature discussed above, there appears to be locations in Spring Valley where there were battle and massacre sites. However, the location of all of these sites cannot be verified on the ground in Spring Valley. The following is an interpretive discussion of these massacre and battle site descriptions and, when possible, their locations in Spring Valley.

Battles vs. Massacres

Before beginning this discussion, it is important to define the difference between a battle and a massacre. These two words have been used rather loosely by many individuals. In the following discussion, I will attempt to use them in a consistent fashion, according to their definitions in the 1999 Random House Webster's Unabridged Dictionary:

Battle: a hostile encounter or engagement between opposing military forces.

Massacre: the unnecessary, indiscriminate killing of a large number of human beings or animals, as in barbarous warfare or persecution or for revenge or plunder.

Wilson's Battle/Massacre Site 1859?

For example, the "battle" with the Indians described by Wilson seems to be the earliest one having occurred before 1860. Geographical analysis of Wilson's description of the battle site places it at the location of a Pony Express Station, which appears to be located on the north end of Spring Valley. However, due to the conflict in the dates provided by Wilson and others as to when it could have occurred and, that he does not specifically identify the location, its validation as an Indian battle/massacre site will have to be deferred until these contradictions and the location can be verified. It is important to note that Wilson used the word "battle" in his book. What may have started out as a battle, obviously, ended as a massacre with the killing of the women, children and the dogs.

Captain Smith's Spring Valley Battle Site 1863

Based on this account it is hard to determine if it was a battle because the only reference used was "hostile band." There is no mention of warriors which would qualify it as a battle. Twenty-three were killed but again there is not mention of who was killed, warriors or others. The fact that most escaped argues for it being a battle, if there were warriors present.

It is interesting to note, that the battle entry from two days earlier specifically states they "attacked the warriors before sunrise" and the entry for Spring Valley only mentions a "hostile band." There is no question about the location of this battle. South of the Cleveland Ranch places them in the area of Steward's Village 12 and Bastian Springs which are located in the Cedar Swamp area. Smith approached the Swamp Cedars from the west and when he saw the Indian camp in the Swamp Cedars, he thought the ground was all the same as they rode toward the camp. They most likely foundered near Spring Creek located in the bottom with its attendant marshy areas. Steward's Figure 9 identifies a marshy area east of Village 12 where Goshute used to conduct mud hen drives (Figure 2).

Steward's Spring Valley Village 12 Massacre Site

Steward states that Village 12 is located about 7 miles south of the Cleveland Ranch. It is shown on his Figure 9 as being located on both sides of a creek that flows east into Spring Creek located in the bottom of Spring Valley. Using Google Earth and plotting a line along the highway from the Cleveland Ranch south shows Bastian Creek located at 7.46 miles. Bastian Creek is the only named creek in this area that flows east off the flank of the Shell Creek Range in a direct line toward Spring Creek and the Swamp Cedar Natural Area. There is no doubt that Bastian Creek is a tributary of Spring Creek and a water source for the Swamp Cedar Natural Area. The El Tejon Sheep Company ranch is located on the east side of the highway on Bastian Creek.

Based on Steward's consultant's description of seven families all being killed by the white soldiers classifies this location as a massacre site in Spring Valley. Steward's precise location site on the ground also documents it as the first verifiable massacre site in Spring Valley. The reference to soldiers also suggests that it occurred during the 1860s.

Malouf's Massacre Site

Based on Malouf's description, there is no question that this a massacre site was located in Spring Valley and Goshutes were the ones massacred but his consultants do not specify an exact location. However, these consultants do make some important ethnographic statements about what the people were doing in Spring Valley when the massacre occurred-- engaged in a Circle Dance. This Circle Dance statement is most likely a reference to the Great Basin Round Dance. Steward (1938:122) states that "Festivals, involving the round dance . . . were held, usually after pine-nut harvest, at various localities, depending partly upon the abundance of seeds" (see discussion above pgs. 11-12).

We already know from the discussion above, that Spring Valley played a key role in the spiritual and religious ceremonies of the three valleys. Spring Valley had three Festival sites, one more than any other valley, and the connection of those Festival sites with the other valley's Festival sites was significant. Given that these individuals were engaged in the Circle Dance/Round Dance, a religious dance, they would have to have been at one of the three closely related Festival sites identified on Steward's (1938:125) Figure 9 (Figure 2). This massacre could have happened at Steward's Village 12 because it fits the description of a massacre and also is the location of a Festival site. There is one Festival site located north and one located south of Village 12 and it could have occurred at either of these Festival sites. The southern Festival site is located in or very near the Swamp Cedar trees and the two north of it are within the viewshed of the Swamp cedar area. The reference to soldiers also suggests that it occurred during the 1860s.

Martineau's Massacre Sites

Both of Martineau's descriptions allow them to be classified as massacres. They both mention Spring Valley but do not give any details about the specific location. One might infer from the second description that the reference to between Baker and Ely would refer to Layton Spring and the Swamp cedar area or the location of the area around Village 12. The reference to soldiers in both accounts also suggests that it occurred during the 1860s. Interestingly, both descriptions have one girl surviving the massacre and living to tell about it.

Spring Valley Massacre Site 1897

The most recent massacre is not documented in the ethnohistorical or ethnographic literature. It comes from the oral history of a Shoshone girl who survived the massacre. Her oral history about the massacre has been documented in a 2006 publication titled *Our Swallow Heritage Volume III: The History of George Swallow's Daughters* by Russell M. Robison. Laurene Mamie Swallow Joseph is pictured on the cover of Volume III and she was one of two young girls who survived this massacre. Mamie Swallow is identified as a Western Shoshone and the foster daughter of George and Anna Swallow (Robison and Robison 2006).

Chapter 2 of Volume III is devoted to *Laurene Mamie Swallow Joseph and Her Family* (Robison and Robison 2006:13-16). Lillian Joseph Stark was the daughter of Mamie Joseph. In 2005, she was 92 years old (DOB 1913) when she recorded the oral history of the Joseph family. Her daughter, Barbra Stark, recorded and transcribed it into a document titled the *Joseph Family History*. According to Robison, most of his Chapter 2 is taken from this document.

Lillian Joseph Stark's grandmother, Mary Joseph, said traveling was a way of life for the Western Shoshone. In about 1895 they left Kanosh, Utah and went to the Goshute Reservation. Later they traveled south down the Snake Valley to Sacramento Pass and went west over the pass into Spring Valley and

stopped at Layton Spring by the Swamp Cedars. Robison speculates that group may have traveled this route before and probably knew about the Swallow Ranch at Shoshone, Nevada and may have worked for the Swallows (Robison and Robison 2006:13).

Lillian Joseph Stark heard the following story from her grandmother Mary Joseph:

In the mid 1890s, a small band of Indians coming from Utah passed through the Goshute Reservation on their journey into the Snake Valley region of Nevada. They crossed Sacramento Pass and proceeded down into Spring Valley where there was water and a thick stand of Swamp Cedars that would afford them shelter and protection from being spotted by the US Calvary that had been following this band of Indians for some time (Robison and Robison 2006:13).

The band was getting something to eat when the Calvary descended upon the Indians slaughtering all but two small girls (*about age 10*) that escaped using a ditch that led to a big mountain (*to the east*). The two girls stayed in the mountain area for about a week. They decided to go in separate directions, one girl (*known as Annie Jack in her adult life*) went back to the Goshute Reservation to live, and the other girl (Lillian's Mom) ventured into (*south*) Spring Valley where she came upon the Swallow Ranch (*at Shoshone, Nevada*). The Swallows took the girl into their home and raised her until she was about 16 years old. The Swallows named her Mamie Swallow (Robison and Robison 2006:13).

Lillian told Robison that all white men who pursued Indians were thought of as the US Calvary. Robison thinks that soldiers were not involved with the massacre and that is probably a “self-appointed militia” who did it. Robison spent a lot of time researching this story and found nothing recorded about it except in the *Joseph Family History* (Robison and Robison 2006:14-15).

The birth date of Mamie Swallow is “Abt 1887” and she was born at White Pine, Nevada. She was married to Joe Joseph in 1903, had children by him and died at age 38 (November 25, 1925) in Baker, White Pine, Nevada (Robison and Robison 2006:xxviii-xxviii, Figure 5). At about age 10 Mamie became an orphaned as a result of the massacre. She lived at the Swallow Ranch until about 16 when in 1903 she married Joe Joseph (Robison and Robison 2006:13). If she was orphaned at age 10 then the massacre would have occurred about 1897.

The Robison and Robison (2006:14-15) document contains three pictures supposedly looking from the possible location of the massacre site. However, no one knows the exact location of the massacre site and all of the pictures are based on speculation. The following are the two specific location references made by Mary Joseph: (1) “Layton Spring” and (2) “where there was water and a thick stand of Swamp Cedars.”

Conclusions: Battle vs. Massacre Sites

Based on the discussion of battles vs. massacres there is one battle site (Smith 1863) and two massacres sites (Steward’s Village 12 site and Mamie Joseph site 1897) and possibly one more massacre site. The most important conclusion about the confirmation of the one battle site and two massacre sites is that the Smith battle site and the Joseph massacres site occurred in the Swamp Cedar Natural area and the massacre of Steward’s Village 12 was within the viewshed of the Swamp Cedar area. These three historical events are significant cultural events to the Confederated Tribes of the Goshute Reservation, Ely Shoshone Tribe and the Duckwater Shoshone Tribe and individual members of these three Tribes. All three reservations have enrolled members who have knowledge of the these battles and massacres and they maintain a significant spiritual and physical connection to Spring Valley and these events that

occurred in the Swamp Cedar area. The specifics of these significant cultural connections to Spring Valley will be discussed below.

NATIVE CONSULTANTS

As part of this 2010 research project, I was to conduct ethnographic interviews with individuals who had knowledge of the events that took place in Spring Valley. Ethnographic fieldwork and interviews were conducted during the months of June and July 2010. I interviewed 7 Native Consultants; 3 on the Goshute Reservation, 3 in Ely, and 1 on the Duckwater Reservation. Their names have been replaced with NC for Native Consultant to protect their identity. I use NC to make sure that the reader knows when I am using a Native Consultant's statement as opposed to other types of consultants. Fortunately, my 2010 consultants were all Native Consultants. To further insure their anonymity, any reference to sex has been eliminated, which makes some of their statements appear grammatically incorrect. The following is a presentation of the consultants' ethnographic statements that pertain to Spring Valley. I have tried to keep the presentation as close to the original discussion as possible. This is how most people engage in casual discussion and, hopefully, it allows the reader greater appreciation for the person sharing such personally important information. The text in brackets, [], are my words.

Native Consultant 1

NC1 heard the Joseph family massacre story from mother who was a daughter of Mamie Joseph. NC1 is a consanguineal grandchild of Mamie Joseph. These are NC1's comments, and emotions about grandmother, the massacre, and the Swamp Cedar area:

It occurred during the Fall (Sept./Oct.) because the family was in the area [Spring Valley] to gather pine nuts. Annie Jack and Mamie were not related. My people did not like the whites coming into their spring areas; [because] all traditional foods were gone or trampled by cattle; so there was conflict. Ranchers located on the springs. History of self-appointed militia in the area. The camp was not a war camp because the arrows were not tipped with rattle snake venom. The older Indians from Ely said they did not have venom tipped arrows because there were children in the camp; it was a gathering camp not a war party.

First heard the story about the age of 3 or 4 because mom [daughter of Mamie] always talked about it. Used to go out there and hunt rabbits until about the age of 12, spring rabbit hunting is the best. Visited it 6 to 8 times a year from age 4 to 16 [moved from the area].

They [her family] did not camp at the spring [Layton Spring] because it would chase the animals away. Stayed on roads and in the trees for camp wood. Indians don't camp on the water. Mom used to tell them to get water and it was a mile or two away—was considered close. If camping or eating in the area; make a little offering of food for whoever wants to come have it—offering to them.

When there [I] leave [offerings of] White sage and Indian tobacco, kinnikinnick; leave some when they go there. [White sage aka sacred sage is used by some Native Americans to cleanse a space of evil spirits or negative energies.]

Used to say our grandmother made game plentiful for us in the Swamp Cedars. When we used to come up this way [living elsewhere] we would have to go out there. It is like a piece of you is out there—it connects the circle; missing piece of the puzzle; connects out there—it's all together.

When [I] do go out there physically; sigh of relief; everything is there now. Something is missing; something is complete—lighter feeling—relief—complete!

[Grandmother] Mamie was used as a comparison [as a child growing up]; eat your vegetables, think about your grandmother out there without anything [after the massacre]; she wasn't picky, she ate everything.

When in Nevada [left the state and returned], meet folks in Baker and [on the way to Baker would] go past Swamp Cedars and talk with grandma. [Visited] Memorial and Labor Days, camp [there] when we were close enough. Continuous thoughts [about it] all [his/her] life; when physically close would go out there. [From]1981 on, visited every year.

If collecting pine nuts, wild onion or Elder berries in the Swamp Cedar area; that one area beckons to him/her.

The Cedars have been a special sacred place for the Shoshone. Good meeting place; oasis; water there in the desert. Something about the area, plant life there not elsewhere, special foods to gather there; special garden, rabbit crop. Very important and it was a special gift; get a gift but give back. Always abundant food place, plants and animals—air is even special!

Native Consultant 2

NC2 heard the Joseph family massacre story from mother who was a daughter of Mamie Joseph. NC2 is a consanguineal grandchild of Mamie Joseph. These are NC2's comments and emotions about grandmother, the massacre, and the Swamp Cedar area:

Two massacres of women and children; are records of these; a third massacre, no records, only oral records; was by vigilantes.

All the Newe people used to gather at Shoshone Cedars; big time as a kid, pine nut season; free flowing water. [A time for] Young people to meet other young people. Shoshone Cedars --a gathering place for the entire Great Basin; prior to WWII. All our families would go out there before the war. During WWII all the young men went off to war and people stopped going. By the time she was in high school they just went as a family. Would stop as a family—may see others but not always on a schedule.

Age 5; remember pine nutting during the day, eat, dancing, sun rise ceremonies. Kids stayed in camp; grandmother took care of us. Mother, whole family; all living in Ely. Her mother used to carry water from the springs in Spring Valley. Kid job [get the water]; camped [in Cedars] when getting pine nuts—but not always getting nuts in Spring Valley. Shoshone Cedars, did not call it Shoshone Cedars, just called it Cedars as a kid.

Mother wanted to show respect for those who were gone. As long as I can remember, mother was very adamant about Memorial Day [visiting gave sites]: Ely, Cedars, Baker and once in awhile White River.

2-3 nights camping, went to the same place in the Cedars; somewhere near the well, grassy area in the tress.

Drive through the area often stops, not every time, feels good driving through—when it does she/he stops.

Every time we went to Baker, they stopped at the Cedars with mother.

The Cedars are a special place to me, my mother and sister. Just visiting a spring is a spiritual experience. Springs are from mother earth “called life” – no water no life.

Trees different, was considered a sacred site; just so different; something magical or mystical about it; whole thing is different there; same as being around a free flowing spring [springs are considered sacred to the Shoshone]; no other place like this.

Cedars, traditional use area and officially a historic site. Would like to see it recognized like the Meadow Mountain Site; rest stop, historical kiosk with bathrooms.

I would like to get it designated as a TCP [Traditional Cultural Property].

Native Consultant 3

NC3 heard the massacre story from grandmother. These are NC2's comments and emotions about the massacre and the Swamp Cedar area:

[He was a] Kid that always stayed with grandparents. Stayed with them [grandparents] for weeks and months. Age 4 on, heard stories from Grandma [DOB 6/28/1911 to 10/10/2001]. Grandma said we are from here [Steptoe Valley]. [Grandma's] Stories were like legends; but they are based on facts. To my grandma-- not legends—it was the truth. Stories were true. [Grandma] Told it to me several times.

They started hearing rumors that the cavalry were coming to wipe out the Indians [in] 3 valleys. Parties [cavalry] split and were coming down both sides [of the valley]. They shared the information with all groups—heard about the attacks. One group in Swamp Cedars; not called that then; was a Shoshone word but cannot remember it; didn't believe it because they said there was a treaty. [1863 Ruby Valley Treaty, 1869 amended, 1869, October 21, ratified.] They stayed where they were and did not make any preparations. She said over there [referring to Spring Valley]. They had no poison arrows. All war arrows dipped in rattle snake poison. They [his grandparents people] left from over here [Steptoe Valley] and they went up into the Schell Creek Mountains to hide. Grandma [people] was in the Schell Range as high as they could get and looked down in Spring Valley. She said “they could see the dust from the soldiers coming down the valley. They [grandma's people] had scouts on both sides [of the valley]. They killed everybody, pregnant women, cut them open, burned the babies and chopped them up. The men cut off the penises and put them in their mouths. No survivors. They went down after the cavalry left and saw what happened. They cleaned up the area.

Thinks this means buried them. That was their place so they buried them there. Think in warm months because of seeing the dust coming. She had an Indian name for the area but cannot remember it. Grandpa would not allow Shoshone because he knew it was changing and you needed to fit in.

Later she said there was probably a place over there [Spring Valley] where there would be a lot of war arrows because they would have been put off to the side. These war arrows were never kept in camp because of the children.

Her belief is that they are buried in the trees. She always wanted to look for the poisoned arrow heads but would not because their spirits were there and she was not comfortable. [The treed area was] just one of the places on their routes; so they were buried where they died. Was brutal, destroying them and dismembering them!

Me and my brother heard the story. Was in the 7th grade; 11 years old, 1974; we went by there [the massacre site] on the way to Baker. She said, “those trees” points. Stopped at the top of the hill on the way to Baker [points to road on the map on the west side of the Swamp Cedars below Sacramento Pass]. Looking down and west and she said “in those trees.” Those trees, the whole big area.

Would not have any bad feeling about going there; to protect it. My gram was a very spiritual person and I carry that trait.

People still there. Should be protected; like a Civil War site, you should not go around disturbing them. Place to be respected. Should not be disturbed.

On 7/26/10, NC3 and I made a field trip from Ely, Nevada, along Hwy 50, toward Baker, Utah to locate the spot where grandmother pointed to the Cedars when was 11 years old (1974). Stopped me just north of Layton Spring and said, “about here.” We got out of the pickup and walked around. Said “not these trees close to the road but over there on that ridge.” Was referring to a high spot beyond the first row of trees, then an open meadow, then a rise in the ground up from the meadow to what he called a ridge lined with cedars. I photographed the location.

Native Consultant 4

An elder from the Goshute Reservation related the following account of a massacre in Spring Valley. In order to preserve the accuracy of the account I have quoted the consultant’s statements as closely as possible and the text in brackets ([]) are my words.

Told from generation to generation. About 10 [1937][we] used to get together and talk about it. [She is] Goshute from the reservation; lived where the new houses area today. Old old man used to live with us; he was blind; [named] Commodore—over 100, very old.

All these people who lived around here [Goshute Reservation area] used to go [to Spring Valley] families and other tribes have a fandango, dancing, hand game, Bear Dance, Round Dance. September for pine nuts. All the bands would gather to thank mother Earth, praying, and dancing. They would have been on foot; everybody there, men, women and children. Goshute and Shoshone the same – Shoshone.

Probably one group; stayed at various areas; when done go their own way. Probably fall of year. One person telling stories; young man; no one believed him. He wandered off by himself [into the] Spring Valley mountains. He came upon a lot of soldiers; he was up high [in the mountains]. Du = black; awsu = shirt wearing—from afar they were wearing something dark.

He ran back to where they were having a fandango; [they were] having a hand game when he got back. He told them about the soldiers; they were going to kill us. Most did not believe him; most of young guys laughed at him. He kept at it—ran into the hand game; was crying and telling what he said was true.

Some believed him. Some medicine-men began to sing to see if what he said was true. Medicine men among them; medicine man threw up blood and said it was their blood. Said he is telling the truth; we better do something about this and go. Some believed and some did not. Some families packed up and headed for the mountains. Medicine man told them to hide where they cannot see you. Next many looked down where they were at—they saw dust and felt bad—heard shooting for quite awhile.

About half of them were killed. In Spring Valley—where it happened—Cedars trees grew—where it all happened. Some of the whites roamed around there to see what happened. Lots of Cedar trees in the valley, not sure where it happened. Survivors went their own way roaming around. No Indians would go there, not go near it; would never return to the area.

[After the massacre] then the cedars grew there [on the site]. One old man living on the Goshute reservation used to go [there] and get things. Bill died in 1970; he was a non-Indian. He knew where the site was. He asked us to go, but we never went. He used to tell us that the cedar trees pushed out a lot of things [as they grew]. Some stuff [remains of the massacre were pushed] up in the trees as they grew.

Native Consultant 5

Another elder on the Goshute Reservation related the following information and feelings about Spring Valley:

As a boy, when we went that way [by Spring Valley] they would say that's where the soldiers killed them. They were camping in the cedars. When they got together; harvest time, dance, pine nuts and hunting, talked to mother earth for what she gave, pray for coming year and food. Indians used to camp here and there; gather to "fandangle" like a powwow; just having a good time dancing and hand games. The South area of Spring Valley, was their winter range; lived in the valley during the winter.

Probably burials; burials should be protected. Cedar tree area should be protected. The whole Cedar area should be sacred. Just worried about the cedar area only. We on the tribe want that a sacred area and protected. Would like to have it as a sacred area, Traditional Cultural Property.

Native Consultant 6

An elder from the Goshute Reservation had written an account of a Spring Valley massacre and provided me with a copy. It has been reproduced exactly as written with identifying information deleted. This consultant made the following comments about the massacre.

Visited the Swamp Cedar annually in the fall because there was water there, pine nuts, deer. They were hunting in Spring Valley. It was a time for gathering time and ceremonies. This was the worst [massacre] that had taken place. People stopped going there after that. Would like to see some type of monument placed there with the story.

My father ___ talked about the massacre that was inflicted on the Goshute and Shoshone people at Swamp Cedar in Spring Valley, Nevada. These tribes were gathered at Swamp Cedar celebrating the five day harvest dance when the soldiers approached their encampment and killed the women, and children, the men were all out hunting except the old grandfathers who stayed behind with the women and children.

When the men came back from their hunt, they found everyone dead at the camp site and witnessed terrible and horrifying scenes. The soldiers raped the women and after raping them stuck sticks into their privates, cut off the penis's of the old men and stuck them into their mouths. Two women escaped and ran into the mountains and lived to tell about it.

Following all of the terrible and horrifying scene they witnessed, all the men made plans to go after the soldiers, it took days of planning. The soldiers were camped in a Canyon which is located due northeast of Ibapah and south of Gold Hill, Utah. John Syme's father-in-law was a shaman and the local Indians called him bullet proof because he had power over matter.

He used certain types of plants to gain powers to protect himself, his family and his people. John Syme was _____. The plan was, John Syme's father in law was to go down into the canyon first and the rest would follow.

John's father-in-law ran down into the canyon first, just like planned, the soldiers were all shooting at him but the bullets didn't penetrate, he reached their encampment. These soldiers were living in canvas tents, he entered the kitchen portion of the tent, crawled under, they were getting ready to eat lunch when John's father-in-law ran down into the canyon and as he entered the kitchen, he saw food and he was helping himself to their lunch then he took a piece of wood and stuck into the stove to get it lit and when it started going he threw it on top of the tent and set it on fire and he did the same with all of their tents including the horse barn. The soldiers gave up because all of the native men were ready to fire at them and everything they had to hide behind was in flame so, they all walked out one behind the other, they gave up, couldn't fight back.

Only one escaped on a horse back but they caught up with him and killed him. One of the soldiers was so scared that he crawled into a barrel of water inside the barn and died in it.

John Syme's wife use to say. I wish people wouldn't talk about it. She was afraid that the soldiers would come after her because her father led the natives down into the canyon and burned down the camp. All of this took place after the massacre at Swamp Cedar at South Spring Valley, NV.

Native Consultant 7

N73 heard the massacre story from grandfather (father's father). These are NC7's comments and emotions about the massacre and the Swamp Cedar area:

Grandfather [father's father], White River Shoshone, travelled all through this country. We used to go to Baker, coming [back on the highway] downhill on the right hand side, about in the trees, he would point out into the Cedars. About [when we] hit the corner going downhill, point out there. [He] would tell [you] a little each time – 3-4 times [told parts of the story].

That's where the Indians got killed and the soldiers that got away were killed by the Goshute.

[Soldiers] must have gone up Spring Valley; good distance. No date or how many. I was 11 or 12, 60 years ago. Just started high school when he told that; went to Baker to visit the Josephs. He died in [19] 57.

Spring Valley used for camping because of lots of water. Creeks on both sides, lots of game and still is, fish, deer, pine nuts. Likes them, quiet there and doesn't bother him; like a sanctuary for him—nothing bothers him. Different for his father and wife.

[His wife] she does not like to go there. I told her about it; she is very spiritual. Went in once with dad and stood on the edge; he did not want to go in; spooked too. Some of these people just don't go where something has happened—deaths—spirits are there.

Doesn't bother him to go in. Two weeks ago went into to the south end [BLM site visit]; 2 women from the BLM, asking what we wanted to keep. "Whole cedars!" They don't understand! Like to see them saved.

Conclusions Based on the Native Consultant's Statements

The Native Consultants had significant concerns about the well-being and protection of the Swamp Cedar area. The following conclusions are based on the statements made by my Native Consultants:

- All seven consultants believe that at least one battle/massacre occurred somewhere among the cedar trees.
- All seven consultants believe that the human remains of the Indians associated with this battle/massacre are still buried somewhere among the cedar trees.
- All seven consultants believe that the spirits of those killed in the battle/massacre continue to inhabit the area and are present today.
- All seven consultants are respectful of these spirits.
- Two consultants are the consanguineal descents of one of the survivors of a massacre.
- Two believe their direct ancestors' spirits inhabit the area.
- Sacred and food offerings have been made to these spirits.
- All seven consultants agree that this area should be protected.
- All of the swamp cedars trees are considered sacred.

- The entire swamp cedar area should be recognized as a sacred area.
- The swamp cedar area should be recognized Traditional Cultural Property.
- Indians buried there.
- Burials should be protected by recognizing the area as an Indian cemetery.
- It should be recognized as a historic site.
- It should be designated as a national monument.
- They want the area recognized with some type of roadside rest area with a historical kiosk telling the story of the area.

SUMMARY ETHNOHISTORICAL/ ETHNOGRAPHIC CONCLUSIONS

- It is clear that the archaeological record has considerable time depth in Spring Valley.
- I have assisted with the recording of archaeological sites among the swamp cedars trees.
- Based on my archaeological field experience in the area, there are significant unrecorded archaeological resources in and adjacent to the swamp cedars.
- Steward's ethnographic data documents the Shoshone/Goshute occupied Spring Valley before and after the time of the Euroamerican invasion.
- Stewards data documents the intensive use (i.e., economic and religious) of the Swamp Cedar area by the Shoshone/Goshute.
- Steward's 16 village locations and their associated cultural activities demonstrates that Spring Valley in general, and the Swamp Cedar area in specific, represent a Traditional Cultural Property of the Shoshone/Goshute.
- The variety of subsistence activities conducted in Spring Valley points out that it was intensively and extensively used and represented a very important economic area to them.
- The Shoshone/Goshute oral history of their use of Spring Valley and the Swamp Cedars shows continuity to July 2010.
- My 2010 research documents the existence of a current belief system about battle/massacre sites in the Swamp Cedars area.
- Shoshone/Goshute occupied Spring Valley until they were removed by force. Even though they were removed from the valley their oral history of Spring Valley has survived through time to the present day.
- The oral history of the massacres has survived the test of time and is a set of belief currently held today by members of the Shoshone/Goshute communities.
- My 2010 research documents that the cedars have been visited by Native Consultants on a number of occasions over the last 60+ years and has been used in a religious (i.e., offerings) and non-religious manner (i.e., subsistence activities such as rabbit hunting, and plant collecting) during that time period and those uses continue to the present day.

TRADITIONAL CULTURAL PROPERTY (TCP)

The following discussion provides important background information on TCPs, criteria for evaluating and recommending a TCP for listing on the NRHP, and the evaluation of the Swamp Cedars Area TCP.

In 1990, the National Park Service commissioned a publication to assist federal agencies in evaluating these types of historic properties for inclusion in the NRHP. Bulletin 38, *Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Traditional Cultural Properties* provided a framework for analysis of site types that are associated with diverse cultural traditions and values identifiable only by the communities, including tribes, which value such sites. The authors provided the following definition of a TCP:

A traditional cultural property, then, can be defined generally as one that is eligible for inclusion in the National Register because of its association with cultural practices or beliefs of a living community that (a) are rooted in that community's history, and (b) are important in maintaining the continuing cultural identity of the community (Parker and King 1990:1).

Since this first definition, King (1998:267, 2004:363, 2008:373) under his own authorship has moved away from the criterion of a TCP having to be eligible for the NRHP as a part of the definition. He states at the end of his new definition in 1998, 2004, and again in 2008 that it “May be eligible for inclusion in the National Register” (King 1998:267, 2004:363, 2008:373).

In 2003, King makes the following comment about the purpose of Bulletin 38. “The bulletin’s purpose was to clarify how such places [TCPs] could be eligible for the National Register and hence accorded a degree of protection by federal law” (King 2003:1). In 2005, King continues to clarify his position on dismissing the requirement for TCPs to be NRHP eligible when he states “a place can be a TCP without being eligible for the National Register” (King 2005:125). He goes on to say:

In other words, the categories *traditional cultural properties* and *National Register—eligible property* are independent of one another, just as, say, the terms *house* and *National Register—eligible building* are independent. I have provided a more general definition in a recent text book on TCPs:

[TCPs are] places that communities think are important, because they—the places—embody or sustain values, character, or cultural coherence (King 2003:1) (King 2005:125).

He says this is “A fancy way of saying places *count* to ordinary people, are held dear by them, whatever significance they may have for professional scholars” (King 2003:1). Further on in King’s 2005 publication he makes his point exceptionally clear when he states:

Significance Is in the Mind

Since the significance of a TCP is based on how people feel about it, it follows that this significance is to be found in the minds of the people, not in physical evidence or in the ground. Arguably, all cultural and historical significance is found in people’s minds—even the mind of archaeologists—but my point here is that a TCP can be significant to people without containing anything discernable to an outsider. The only way we can find out about such significance is by asking people, and we need to ask them in ways that are likely to elicit useful answers rather than making them clam up. This makes good ethnographic practice particularly relevant to the identification and management of TCPs (King 2005:127).

In King's 2008, 3rd edition of the *Cultural Resource Laws and Practice* text he defines TCP as follows:

Traditional cultural property or traditional cultural place (TCP): A place that is valued by a community for the role it plays in sustaining the community's cultural identity. Generally figures in important community traditions or socioculturally important activities. **May be eligible for inclusion in the National Register** [emphasis Lahren] (King 2008:373).

In King's (2005:126) discussion of the differences between Indigenous and Non-Indigenous TCPs, he states that the very first page of Bulletin 38 gives examples of places that may be National Register eligible.

"Traditional" in this context refers to those beliefs, customs, and practices of a living community of people that have been passed down through the generations, usually orally or through practice. The traditional cultural significance of a historic property, then, is significance derived from the role the property plays in a community's historically rooted beliefs, customs, and practices. Examples of properties possessing such significance include:

- a location associated with the traditional beliefs of a Native American group about its origins, its cultural history, or the nature of the world; . . . (Parker and King 1990:1).

TCP types can be, but are not limited to, ceremonial sites, habitation sites, traditional origin locations, resource collection areas for subsistence or ceremonial use (includes mineral, plant, and water sources), burial sites, trails, caves and rockshelters, and ethnohistorical locations.

To qualify for nomination to the NRHP as a Historic Property, a TCP must be more than 50 years old, must be a place with definable boundaries, must retain integrity (condition, relationship to culture group). Criteria used to evaluate historic properties and TCPs consider the following factors:

- (a) Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.
- (b) Association with the lives of persons significant in our past.
- (c) Embodiment of the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or that representative of the work of a master, or possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.
- (d) History or yielding, or potential to yield, information important in prehistory or history (Parker and King 1990:11-17)

Certain site types, such as burials and cemeteries, are excluded from the NRHP; however, both these site types can be included under certain conditions.

Swamp Cedar Area Traditional Cultural Property Evaluation

Based on the ethnohistorical literature research and the ethnographic data collected from Native Consultants during fieldwork for this study, the Swamp Cedars Area is defined as a Traditional Cultural Property (TCP) and is recommended eligible to the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) under Criterion A and D.

The Swamp Cedar area is eligible to the NRHP under Criterion A because it is considered representative of the inappropriate invasion of the area by Euroamericans (i.e., a broad pattern of western history), without any consideration of or permission from the Indians occupying the area. That invasion and

appropriation of Shoshone/Goshute lands resulted in a significant number of hostilities, battles and the massacre of Indians to eliminate what some Euroamericans called the “Indian problem.” The events that occurred in Spring Valley and the Cedars represent significant cultural-historical events for the Shoshone/Goshute people and they played a significant role in the development of their relationship with the invading Euroamericans. The history of these events continues to figure prominently in the contemporary reservation dynamics of the Confederated Tribes of the Goshute Reservation, Ely Shoshone Tribe, and Duckwater Shoshone Tribe when dealing with non-Indians today.

The site is significant to the Shoshone/Goshute people because of their historic association with this homeland of theirs and the ongoing cultural and spiritual activities associated with the area. While the Swamp Cedars has been modified by ranching activities and modern road construction around it, the integrity of the viewshed of the site, the area as a camping location and as a spiritual location has experienced minimal changes. There is a historic and current belief that members of Indian people slain by the Euroamericans still inhabit the area today. Native consultants can still go into the cedars today and obtain the historic feeling of that setting as experienced by their ancestors and show respect for the spirits of their ancestors. The “cedars” is also considered to be a sacred place to the Shoshone/Goshute.

The Swamp Cedar area is eligible to the NRHP under Criterion D because the recent Class III archaeological survey conducted among the cedar trees has yielded a number of significant sites that are eligible to the NRHP under Criterion D because of their data potential for subsurface deposits. The Class III archeological report also documents that there was a larger number of new archaeological sites recorded during the survey and that about half of them were eligible to the NRHP.

The Swamp Cedar area is eligible to the NRHP under Criterion D because the entire cedar area has not been systematically surveyed and it has the potential to yield significant information about the prehistory of the area as well as the proto-historic and ethnographic periods. A systematic survey of the cedars and the adjacent uplands has the potential to yield information about these important archaeological and ethnographic landscapes. Locating Village 12 and the sites around Bastain and Layton Springs have important data potential for understanding the historic use of the valley system as a complete cultural landscape (i.e., all cultural resources, not just archaeological resources).

As stated above, it does not matter whether anyone agrees or disagrees with my recommendations for it to be eligible under Criterion A and D. Determining eligibility is a distinct separate activity based on the application of the criteria listed above. If recommended eligible, it may provide an additional layer of protection as voiced by King. Whether or not it is eligible does not qualify or disqualify it as a TCP. The statements by the Native Consultants document that the entire Swamp Cedar Area is a significant Shoshone/Goshute cultural resource in their minds and they want it protected; hence, ipso facto a TCP.

Recommendation for Protection of the TCP

To protect this Shoshone/Goshute culturally significant area, I recommend a one mile buffer around all of the Sacred Cedar trees in order to preserve the feeling and setting of the site as a spiritual location. A protective buffer would help prevent future visual and auditory impacts to the site. Shoshone/Goshute consultants stated that they wanted the Cedars to be respected by visitors and protected as a spiritual location. Any significant development in the area that impacts the viewshed of and from within the Cedars will have an adverse effect on this important cultural resource.

ETHNOGRAPHIC LANDSCAPE

According to the National Park Service Preservation Brief number 36:

A **cultural landscape** is defined as "a geographic area, including both cultural and natural resources and the wildlife or domestic animals therein, associated with a historic event, activity, or person or exhibiting other cultural or aesthetic values." There are four general types of cultural landscapes, not mutually exclusive: [1] *historic sites*, [2] *historic designed landscapes*, [3] *historic vernacular landscapes*, and [4] *ethnographic landscapes* (Birnbaum 1994:2)."

Based on the analysis ethnohistorical literature and the ethnographic data provided by the Native Consultants, the Swamp Cedar area can be classified as two of these site types:

Historic Site--a landscape significant for its association with a historic event, activity, or person. Examples include battlefields and president's house properties (Birnbaum 1994:2)..

Ethnographic Landscape--a landscape containing a variety of natural and cultural resources that associated people define as heritage resources. Examples are contemporary settlements, religious sacred sites and massive geological structures. Small plant communities, animals, subsistence and ceremonial grounds are often components (Birnbaum 1994:2).

Cultural landscapes give us a sense of place. They reveal our relationship with the land over time. They are part of our national heritage, and part of each of our lives. Cultural landscapes are a legacy for everyone. Through their form, features, and the ways they are used, cultural landscapes reveal much about our evolving relationships with the natural world. They provide scenic, economic, ecological, social, recreational, and educational opportunities which help individuals, communities and nations understand themselves (Birnbaum 1994).

As discussed above, ethnohistorical and ethnographic data collected from the consultants, documents Spring Valley and the Cedars as the center of a traditional use area. The prehistoric archaeological sites located in the area, Steward's 16 villages, three Festivals sites and their connections to the adjoining valleys, the abundance of water in the valley, the abundance of flora and fauna, the history of Euroamerican and Indian hostilities in the area, battles and massacres in the Cedars, and the continuous and ongoing contemporary use of the area for many years, all document continuous use of the area by Shoshone/Goshute. It is the essence of everything that occurred both natural and cultural; where the two cannot be separated, as is the case with the Swamp Cedar area.

For these reasons, the Swamp Cedars and surrounding areas in Spring Valley can be identified as an Ethnographic Landscape. This ethnohistorical and ethnographic study provides an appropriate foundation for defining it as a Shoshone/Goshute Ethnographic Landscape because the study has documented the cultural significance of the Cedars in Spring Valley, as understood by native people. Village 12 and Layton Spring are historic sites and should be recorded. I think one could also argue that the Cedars is a historic site, if not a feature of Layton Spring historic site.

EXECUTIVE ORDER 13007, INDIAN SACRED LAND EXECUTIVE ORDER

And last but not least in this regard is Executive Order 13007. This Executive Order (Clinton 1996) is relevant to the preservation of American Indian cultural sites. It directs federal land managers (1) To accommodate access to and ceremonial use of Indian sacred sites by Indian religious practitioners, (2) To

avoid adversely affecting the physical integrity of such sacred sites, and (3) To maintain the confidentiality of such sacred sites as appropriate. The order specifically addresses sacred site protection and requires consultation. The ethnographic facts that (1) the Shoshone/Goshute consultants consider the Cedars to be a sacred area, (2) that ancestors and family members were massacred there, (3) that the area is inhabited by the spirits of these people, and (4) that descendents of those massacred and other members of the Shoshone/Goshute community have maintained and practiced a physical and spiritual connection to the area, seems to make Executive Order 13007, particularly applicable to this significant sacred cultural resource.

REFERENCES CITED

Aikens, C. M. and D. B. Madsen

- 1986 Prehistory of the Eastern Area. In Handbook of North American Indians, Volume 11, Great Basin, edited by W. L. D'Azevedo, pp. 149-160, William C. Sturtevant, general editor. Smithsonian Institution Press, Washington, D.C.

Angel, Myron

- 1881 History of the State of Nevada. Thompson and West, Oakland, California.

Arkush, Brooke S.

- 1999 Numic Pronghorn Exploitation: A Reassessment of Stewardian-Derived Models of Big-Game Hunting in the Great Basin. In Julian Steward and the Great Basin: The Making of an Anthropologist, edited by Richard O. Clemmer, L. Daniel Myers and Mary Elizabeth Rudden. University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City.

Bateman, Ronald R.

- 1984 Deep Creek Reflections: 125 Years of Settlement at Ibapah, Utah 1859-1984, Salt Lake City.

Clinton, William H.

- 1996 Executive Order 13007. Indian Sacred Land Executive Order.

Crum, Steven J.

- 1994 The Road On Which We Came. University of Utah, Salt Lake City.

d'Azevedo, W. L.

- 1986 Great Basin. In Handbook of North American Indians, Vol. 11, edited by W. C. Sturtevant. Smithsonian Institution, Washington, D.C.

Egan, William M. (editor)

- 1917 Pioneering the West, 1846 to 1878: Major Howard Egan's Diary; Also: Thrilling Experiences of Pre-Frontier Life Among Indians; Their Traits, Civil and Savage, and Part of Autobiography, Inter-Related to his Father's, by Howard R. Egan. Howard R. Egan Estate, Richmond, Utah.

King, Thomas F.

- 2008 Cultural Resource Laws and Practice: An Introductory Guide. 3rd ed. Heritage Resources Management Series. AltaMira Press, New York.
- 2005 What Are Traditional Cultural Properties? *The Applied Anthropologist* 25(2):125-130.
- 2004 Cultural Resource Laws and Practice: An Introductory Guide. 2nd ed. Heritage Resources Management Series. AltaMira Press, New York.
- 2003 Places That Count: Traditional Cultural Properties in Cultural Resource Management. Heritage Resources Management Series. AltaMira Press, Walnut Creek.

- 1998 Cultural Resource Laws and Practice: An Introductory Guide. Heritage Resources Management Series. AltaMira Press, Walnut Creek.
- Lahren, Sylvester L. JR.
2010 Unpublished Field Notes.
- Madsen, D. B. and S. R. Simms
1998 The Fremont Complex: A Behavioral Perspective. *Journal of World Prehistory* 12(3):255–336.
- Madsen, D. B., C. G. Oviatt and D. N. Schmitt
2005 A Geomorphic, Environmental, and Cultural History of the Camels Back Cave Region. In *Camels Back Cave*, edited by D. N. Schmitt and D. B. Madsen. University of Utah Anthropological Papers No. 125. University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City.
- Malouf, Carling
1940 A Study of the Gosiute Indians of Utah. Master's Thesis, Anthropology, University of Utah, Salt Lake City.
- Martineau, LeVan
1992 The Southern Paiutes: Legends Lore Language and Lineage. 1st ed. KC Publications, Las Vegas.
- Mathis, Don Richard
1959 Camp Floyd in Retrospect, Department of History, University of Utah, Salt Lake City.
- Murphy, R.F. and Y. Murphy
1986 Northern Shoshone and Bannock. In *Handbook of North American Indians*, edited by W. L. D'Azevedo, pp. 284-307, Vol. 11: Great Basin, William C. Sturtevant, general editor. Smithsonian Institution, Washington D.C.
- Parker, Patricia L. and Thomas F. King
1990 Guidelines for Evaluating and Documenting Traditional Cultural Properties. Revised ed. *National Register Bulletin* Vol. 38. National Park Service, Washington, D.C.
- Robison, Russell M. and Gloria J. Robison
2006 Our Swallow Heritage Volume III The History of George Swallow's Daughter Vol. III. Privately printed.
- Schmitt, Dave N. and David B. Madsen
2005 Camels Back Cave. University of Utah Anthropological Papers Number 125. University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City.
- Sharp, J. P. and G. Bennion
1936 One Indian's Vengeance. In *The Improvement Era*, Vol. 39, Salt Lake City.
- Simpson, James H.
1876 Report of Explorations across the Great Basin of the Territory of Utah for a Direct Wagon-Route from Camp Floyd to Genoa, in Carson Valley, in 1859. Government Printing Office, Washington, D.C.

Steward, Julian H.

1938 Basin-Plateau Aboriginal Sociopolitical Groups. Bureau of American Ethnology Bulletin 120, Smithsonian Institution. Reprinted (1997). University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City, UT.

Wilson, Elijah N.

1910 Among the Shoshones. Skelton Publishing Company, Salt Lake City. Originally published 1910, reprinted 1971.

Wilson, Elijah N. and Charles A. Wilson

2005 The White Indian Boy and The Return of the White Indian. 2005. The University of Utah Press, Salt Lake City. Originally published 1985.